

**TOWN OF PROVINCETOWN - BOARD OF SELECTMEN  
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES  
TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 24, 2015 5:00 PM  
TOWN HALL – JUDGE WELSH ROOM**

Chairman Donegan convened the meeting at 5:08PM noting the following:

Board of Selectmen attending: Tom Donegan, Erik Yingling, and Robert Anthony

Excused: Cheryl Andrews and Raphael Richter.

Other attendees: Acting Town Manager David Gardner

Recorder: Loretta Dougherty

Tom said that due to absences of Selectmen Andrews, our Pier Liaison, we will postpone the Joint Meeting with the Provincetown Public Pier Corporation (PPPC) until the March 4<sup>th</sup> meeting, if that is possible for them. We will be interviewing three candidates this evening to be the Search Consultant for the Town Manager position. Tom outlined the processes being followed for this selection.

- |                  |   |
|------------------|---|
| First process –  | Evaluations by staff have been done to meet minimal criteria; all met.  |
| Second process – | Qualitative review criteria; done by Board of Selectmen (BOS); highly advantageous; advantageous; not advantageous or unacceptable. |
| Third process –  | Price criteria; David will bring the sealed envelopes in after scoring for the BOS to review financial proposals.                   |

**Agenda Item 1. Interview Search Consultants:**

- 5:15 PM Colin Baenziger (Colin Baenziger & Associates) (1)
- 6:00 PM Andrea Sims (Waters & Company) (2)
- 6:45 PM Joellen Earl (Voorhees Associates) (3)

(1) Tom introduced Colin Baenziger (Colin Baenziger & Associates) and Colin gave a brief overview of his proposal. Started his firm in 1997 and started Executive Searches in 1998. He does a good job and charges reasonable prices. He was not impressed with other firms he saw doing this kind of work when he first started. He wanted to be home in am or pm because he was a single dad with two children. He is nationally recognized. He is focused on providing a quality product. It is a big decision to hire a Town Manager and we need someone knowledgeable and available to get us through the process. His key employees are former city and county managers. Every one of his searches has been successful and they are reliable and thorough. All background work is done before he refers to us. We pay only what is quoted; sometime less but never more. He is always on schedule and has never missed any major milestones. He will have a Town Manager towards the end of May 2015. He guarantees for two years. He will always be available. He will sit down and get to know our people and community, what issues we are dealing with, what we are looking for in a Town Manager, and what challenges there may be. Candidates want to know about the community and the people they will be working with. Colin looked at one of our meetings online. He will write a recruitment profile including information about opportunities and community life in Provincetown, what resources are available and what kind of person will be best fit for us. He will present enough in-

formation so a candidate can determine without having to do any additional research before they make a decision that this is what they want to look into. He will present the community in a positive light. He knows that Provincetown's high school is no longer open and this may not be where someone would want to be. He will do extensive networking. He will run ads and has an emailing list with 12,000 people on it (city/county towns). If they are not interested they may know someone from MA and they will forward that email. We have about 3 weeks. We want to create buzz to talk about this job; we will reach 200-300 people with telephone calls. When the closing date has past he will look at the resumes and screen re: important criteria. He will pick out about 10-15 and call each one and he will give them the column test – series of questions he will ask. He will turn them over to staff and have each candidate present information about themselves, getting 20 references from them with telephone numbers. The goal is to reach at least 10 out to all of them as some may be on vacation or unable to be reached. Background checks will consist of criminal and civil records checks, motor vehicle, bankruptcy, and employment checks as well as doing internet searches (local newspapers). He gets all the information together and then makes a judgment. He wants to present 8-10 candidates; fully vetted. He sends all of the information electronically and then he will come up and talk with us. The field will be narrowed down to 5 candidates. He wants us to see the candidate in social settings so there will be a reception, and then a one-on-one interview with elected officials will be held to determine whether there is good chemistry among them. Lastly, there will be a group interview setting before the BOS lasting about 20-30 minutes. The community will be invited to come to the reception and group interviews also. We will spend a day or two thinking about it and then pick the candidate. He will help negotiate contract, if we like. If we start on March 5 or 6<sup>th</sup> we will be done by May 27<sup>th</sup>. The guarantee he offers is one of the best. If the candidate leaves within the 1<sup>st</sup> yr. Colin will replace him/her by going through the whole process again with no charge or cost to us. If the candidate leaves within the 2<sup>nd</sup> yr. the whole process will be gone through again with no professional services fee charged only the costs for expenses. Colin referred to the copy of the resolution in back of the proposal. Colin finished his overview stating that this is what his company will do.

Robert wanted to know about municipalities; searching for people that know municipal finances in MA; out of 12,000 do you just randomly send it to them?

Colin is going to do networking within MA but all recruitment materials go out to all 12,000.

Tom asked him to talk a little about the timelines he has reached in past searches.

Colin has never missed a deadline. He will deliver products as scheduled.

Tom asked him whether in his experience it is best to work with a screening committee or best to work with just the BOS.

Colin will comply with whatever the BOS want to do it; he would prefer to work only with BOS. However, he mentioned that one area where citizen advisory is good is at the very beginning to get more input from all people.

Erik asked if he was confident we can finish the search by May; is this not too aggressive?

Colin said the typical search is 88 days. We take cover page and email it to prospective candidates.

Erik complemented him on presentation materials done for other communities which show various locations and pictures of the community.

Colin feels it will be helpful for people to see in deciding if this is where they want to live or not.

Tom was very impressed with the search done for our former Town Manager Sharon Lynn. Colin captured her strengths in the presentation. Tom was glad to see how he did her presentation. Tom thanked him and told him that we have two more interviews tonight. The BOS will review all of them and be back to Colin.

Colin thanked the BOS for the opportunity.

Timeline: End of May 2015

- (2) Tom spoke with Andrea Sims (Waters & Company) and explained the process to her. Andrea thanked the BOS for selecting her firm to interview and gave a brief overview of the technical proposal before the BOS. Her firm takes a lot of pride in their work. Waters & Co. do Executive Recruitments which include Town Managers and Police Chiefs. They have been doing recruitment in the public sector for over 30 years. They do quality, first rate work so it is possible for the Town to make the best decision. Their firm spends time finding out what we want in a Town Mgr. Andrea will come and speak to each full board and/or screening committee for input in what we are looking for in a Town Manager. They will get our responses to their Management Assessment Survey; it profiles what characteristics are most important to us. They will make sure that everything is put together to help sell the community as a whole. We do direct marketing calls throughout the country. She does 100% reviewing of the resumes with regards to municipal management skills. She will bring the resumes and questionnaires back to meet with the BOS and go over all the candidates. They will record short video sessions of the candidates answering some questions to show us. At the end of the meeting will make up a list of finalists and will be invited to interview; will do background checks, reference checks. Offer guarantee is if they do not stay at least 2 yrs. she will go back and do recruitment on our behalf. If we can't come to a conclusion, she will redo recruitment for expenses no professional fees.

Robert wanted to know if she does mailings; does internet?

Andrea does emails, telephones, and mailings.

Robert wanted to know about holding to the timeline?

Andrea will hold to the timeline. It usually takes a couple of months to get it done. 30 days of advertising up to 3 wks. Conferences make known at these as well.

Erik had no questions.

Tom wanted to know how broadly she does the recruiting; New England, Northeast or Nationally?

Andrea will start nationally. She has done work for Connecticut. You also find people who want to get back to the east. The pool of individuals selected as finalists usually live or want to live in the area.

Tom wanted to know if the search will be completed within the scheduled period of time; does it happen often?

Andrea stated that it depends on people's availability. It usually works out in the time scheduled.

Tom thanked her and for having had flexibility in taking our call early. We have one more interview and we will then make decision.

Timeline: End of May 2015.

- (3) Tom introduced Joellen Earl (Voorhees Associates) having called a few minutes early and she was on the road. Tom told her we would call her back in about 5 minutes so she would be safe and sound to do the interview. He called back and explained the process for tonight and asked her present herself to us.

Joellen gave a quick overview of how she would do the work. She does use a co-consultant, Thomas Groux. She asked whether we would have a search committee or would it just be the BOS.

Tom told her we would have a small search committee (SC) with two BOS on it.

Joellen will come out and meet with the BOS to get a profile of what the Town wants. They will advertise the position and cast a wide net. They will come back and present the candidates

they want to interview. She will be on site for the interviews and will help with the contract, if needed. The process usually takes about 12 weeks until you have any offers.

Tom asked about using Thomas Groux and Associates (co-consultants).

Joellen worked on the Cape many years ago. Thomas is a retired manager and will work with her, as he brings perspective for the Cape.

Tom noted that was an interesting twist. He asked her to talk about what she has done in MA. Joellen worked in state government and is very familiar with the Cape as she lived in Dennis for 11 years. She spoke of her familiarity with Provincetown as being a unique location; its seasonal population, and community issues. She understands that we need to have the right person to be here in this particular community.

Robert appreciates her knowledge of the Cape. In reaching out to candidates he wanted to know if she would depend only on MMA or ICA. Where will she be looking for candidates?

Joellen will go through those normal channels you look through; MMA and ICA are good sources as a base. What type of net do we want to cast? Infrastructure issues; online schools; search engine they use casts a large net. Heavy recruiting will be done through social media and website; giant database in this profession. She will target direct outreach within that database. She will send a brochure with cover letter to do networking to pass along, should our targeted recipient not be interested. They do this nationally which may reach people who are from this area and may want to come back home but may live in a different area.

Tom asked if recruitment of non-government individuals is done; other groups rather than government.

Joellen can target finance groups if we want those types of skills; not just those who have government skills. We will look at the whole situation and based on what SC/BOS tells her she will fine tune it.

Erik had no questions.

Tom asked if she finds that her scheduling timeline is accomplished.

Joellen said that the only issue right now is when SC/BOS wants to get started. Once started it will take 12 weeks. She can be in Provincetown and stay near without incurring any more fees.

Tom thanked her for your flexibility in taking time to talk with us in her car.

Joellen will be excited to work with us and happy to help in that regard.

Timeline: End May 2015

Scores presented by David for qualitative review criteria: all were rated highly advantageous with Colin (Colin Baenziger & Associates) rating highest of all in terms of points; Joellen (GovHR) was rated next highest and lastly, Andrea (Waters & Company).

BOS spoke among themselves regarding some of the pricing: Colin- \$23,000 (beyond scope \$125/hr.); Joellen- \$17,500; Andrea- \$24,500 plus additional meetings \$1,500/day beyond. At this point Andrea was eliminated.

Erik likes having the guarantee from Colin and the presentation was very clear as to what we are getting. He liked his presentation documents. Erik did not like the presentation documents from Joellen and she did not offer us any guarantees.

Robert liked Colin's assertiveness, presentation documents, and guarantees. He wondered about Joellen relying on other people outside her company to assist in the search. He liked that the MMA will be utilized. He was not very impressed with her presentation documents.

Tom commended Colin on his ability to identify qualities of an individual citing the presentation he had seen done on former Town Manager Sharon Lynn in identifying her qualities. His presentation documents were the best out of the three submitted. He asked if we should wait for the other Selectmen before making the final decision.

Erik told him that Selectman Richter said the decision could be made without him.

Tom will take a vote, but if Cheryl has any objections she can let the BOS know.

**MOVE that the Board of Selectmen Offer the Contract to Colin Baenziger & Associates.**

**Motion: Erik Yingling**

**Seconded: Robert Anthony**

**3/0/0**

**Agenda Item 2. Joint Meeting with Provincetown Public Pier Corporation.FY2016 Proposed Budget, Five-Year Financial Plan, and Management Agreement Negotiations**

Tom is rescheduling the Joint meeting with the PPPC for Wednesday, March 4, 2015. The Joint meeting with FinCom to Reconcile the FY2016 Budget will be set for a later date. Staff will make sure that all Public Hearing Notices are published in a timely fashion for warrants.

Tabled to be rescheduled.

**Agenda Item 3. Other**

None

Without objection meeting was adjourned at 6:50 pm.