

Recycling and Renewable Energy Committee

Minutes from 8 May, 2013 at 6pm
Caucus Hall, Provincetown Town Hall

Attending: Lydia Hamnquist, Laura Ludwig, Elise Cozzi; David Gardner (staff); Maggie Downey and Kevin Galligan, Cape Light Compact; and approximately 24 members of the general public attending to learn about LED streetlight program.

Meeting was called to order at 6pm and Lydia stated that there is a great amount of concern in the community with the blue color of the streetlights and that we would like to know whether we can have LEDs with a warmer light.

Maggie Downey began the full response by providing background on the technology and process of their installation offer to Provincetown. Provincetown is a member of Cape Light Compact. CLC facilitated streetlight purchase all over the Cape in 2002 or so. At that time, Provincetown purchased the streetlights, and CLC negotiated the purchase, installation and maintenance of the lights. CLC contracted with Seimens (formerly Republic) to maintain them, and saved hundreds of thousands of dollars across the Cape by negotiating for municipalities Cape-wide. Towns became interested in LEDs about four years ago, and asked CLC to investigate. The technology was still quite young, and CLC urged towns to wait. Now it has become more cost effective.

NStar will be retrofitting their lights with LED across MA without consulting the towns. But because Provincetown owns its lights, we have a choice of what to replace them with. Staff worked with RREC and DPW over the past 3 years to come up with this pilot project, attending the BOS meeting and conducting a survey on Survey Monkey. CLC is putting together town-specific lighting specs for the RFP which will go out to prospective bidders next month, so Provincetown needs to provide input and feedback on its decisions very soon.

Kevin Galligan, chief engineer and project manager for the streetlight installations, dispelled the rumor that the fixtures are cheap. The manufacturer is Cree, and it is well-made, exceeding governmental regulations for emissions. Kevin is compiling a long list of specs to go out to bid with, including color, size, and quality specifications. The pilot lights installed on Commercial and Court streets are 6000 Kelvin, which was to be the standard spec in the RFP. Due to feedback through the survey, they changed the new spec standard to be 4300 Kelvin; the lowest available Kelvin rate is 3000, but it is a special order. [the lower the K rate, the "warmer" (less blue) the light] Maggie handed out a 16-page presentation on the LED retrofit project, which provides an overview of the participation agreement and refers to Exhibit A of the RFP – if a town wants to change anything on the lighting specs, it can make special requests as part of Exhibit A and must give those details before the RFP is released. The deadline for town input is June 14, 2013. All town input will be bundled into the RFP. Changes requested or required after that date will doubtless incur additional costs.

There are 14,000 streetlights across the Cape being retrofitted with LEDs through this offer; 400+ in Provincetown. The savings comes from buying "in bulk", from energy costs, and once installed, in reduced maintenance costs.

Kevin demonstrated the light for the purposes of discussion and edification. The lights in the pilot project did not have the "backlight controls" or hoods that help direct the light and keep it from shining where it's not wanted. Maggie encouraged the town to provide as much feedback to CLC as possible. She encouraged RREC to help Staff to get input, and said that Provincetown gave the most feedback on their survey (50% of all responses). She reminded us that Exhibit A would specify our particular conditions and choices, and agreed that Provincetown is quite a different town than, say, Dennis, particularly in its distinction as a pedestrian (vs. driving) town. She said there are sample lights installed in Barnstable on 6A at the intersection of Finneys Lane which are 4300 Kelvin and feature the backlight controls. She suggested that we install four of those lower Kelvin units to see whether it is an improvement for Provincetown; they could be installed in about 6 weeks. Provincetown does not have to enter into this agreement with CLC, but to do it without this program would be very expensive.

At this time the meeting was opened to the public (6:25pm). Polly Burnell expressed horror at the look of the lights, though she is not opposed to LED technology. She would like to hone the color/tone of the light to be more appropriate for the Historic District. John Dowd agreed and requested that the four sample 4300K lights be installed in the west end near his community, which includes many artists.

Kevin stated that no LED would ever give a "warm" light, but a lower Kelvin rating would be lower on the blue spectrum. 3000 Kelvin lights are available, but may be an additional cost to the town as they are special order.

The audience agreed that pools of light are preferable to a wash, but LEDs are directional by design. Rachel _____ said the fixture itself is uglier than our existing ones, and wondered if there are options for fixtures that look less modern, and whether a filter can be applied to the light. Kevin said the answer to both is yes. The fixture is chosen for its weatherproofness and resilience but we could request one similar to the cobra head. And, we could put a filter on the light but it would reduce the efficiency, and the town would have to absorb the increased cost. He suggested checking the DOE's Solid State Lighting Consortium website, which has lots of sample installations to provide ideas for different fixtures.

John Dowd said that aesthetics are the only consideration for Provincetown, and that price doesn't matter.

The CLC wants to get it right in Provincetown, and supported us doing another sample run with the lower Kelvin lights. Drop dead timeline for our decision to be included in the bid or not is July 12, 2013, so even though the sample lights may not be installed until after June 14 (deadline for our specs), we could at least get a chance to view the lower K lights before the RFP is released on July 12.

Maggie and Kevin informed us that the town can request different lighting for different sections of town. It was discussed that the streetlights be mapped and sections marked as to higher or lower Kelvin rates. David Gardner said he had a list of all the streetlight poles and those could be mapped out.

Any specific requests would be included in Exhibit A of the RFP, including the choice of light placement. We could also request the future capability to retrofit the fixtures with a solar module, for example.

CLC discussion wrapped at 7:40pm so Kevin could get down to the west end to check the stats of the four light poles to be retrofitted with the lower Kelvin lights. General public departed, except for Jen Rumpza, who is to become a new member of the RREC, and stayed on to participate in the remainder of our discussion.

Lydia motioned to accept the draft of the RREC's recommendation to the BOS regarding how to proceed with the MSW contract. Elise seconded the motion and discussion ensued. We reviewed the four options that we had distilled over the past four months of research –

- > 1. Privatize everything (commercial and residential)
 - > 2. PAYT (curbside users)
 - > 3. PAYT + levying fee to businesses to share the cost of community trash
 - > 4. Taxpayer bill increase + dumping fee increase for commercial haulers
- RREC recommends the fourth option, despite the fact that the tax increase would be based on mil rate, vs. number of bedrooms (as was proposed in an earlier meeting), based on the meeting that Rich Waldo had with the town tax assessor. All three members were in favor of the recommendation; Carla Anderson was in favor, in absentia. Set the next meeting time/date/agenda:

Thursday, 23 May 2013 at 10:00am
Caucus Hall, Provincetown Town Hall

- Review committee membership
- Prepare for BOS meeting on 5/28
- Approve minutes
- Other business

Laura motioned to adjourn; Lydia seconded and all were in favor. Meeting was adjourned at 8:20 pm.