

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

August 7, 2013

WORK SESSION 3:30 P.M.

JUDGE WELSH ROOM

Members Present: Mr. John Dowd, Mr. Thomas Biggert, Mr. Lance Hatch, Ms. Polly Burnell (arrived at 4:00 P.M.) and Mr. Ryan Landry.

Excused Absence: Ms. Marcene Marcoux and Mr. David McGlothlin.

Other Staff Present: Ms. Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator.

John Dowd called the Work Session to order at 3:40 P.M.

Public Comments:

None.

Administrative Reviews:

- **Case #FY14-03 – 39 Bradford Street, Unit #1, Provincetown, MA**
Pavel Fiodarau, on behalf of Brad Mallow and Daniel Skahen, requested the addition of two awning windows and the replacement of a door on the Conant Street side in the back of the structure. This matter was discussed at the meeting of July 17, 2013. The applicant seeks a larger door. After discussion with Mr. Fiodarau, the Commission approved the replacement of the two windows but did not approve the larger door.
- **24 Pearl Street, Provincetown, MA**
Derik Burgess of Cape Associates, Inc., on behalf of the Fine Arts Work Center, is seeking a decision by the Commission as to whether the proposed replacement of 23 windows and 4 doors to match the existing is an Administrative Review or will require a full hearing. The Commission ruled that the project would be heard as an Administrative Review.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **533 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**
Derik Burgess requested the replacement of 1 Andersen French door with a door of the same size. This is a replacement in kind of a damaged door.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **191 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**
Derik Burgess requested the replacement 2 existing beach front Andersen sliding doors on the ground floor of the structure. The replacement will be a NanaWall

door system.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **269A Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA**

Mike Bedard, of Renewal by Andersen, on behalf of Hazel Warner, requested the replacement of 5 double-hung windows with the same grid pattern. The Commission reminded Mr. Bedard that the guidelines required exterior-applied muttons if the windows are visible from a public way. Only 3 of the 5 will require exterior-applied muttons.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **155 Commercial Street, Unit #4, Provincetown, MA**

Mike Bedard, of Renewal by Andersen, on behalf of Elaine Carmen and Patricia Ricker, requested the replacement of 3 windows in kind. The windows will be 6 over 6.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **118 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**

Harry Palmer, on behalf of William Hendrickson, to replace in kind a porch on the northeast corner of the house. This matter has been postponed.

- **67 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**

Scott Cyzoski and Beau Fillion, on behalf of Judy Mencher, requested to remove a non-functional chimney. A faux chimney that will replace the existing and will have the same dimensions.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **242 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA**

Peter Grosso, on behalf of Cynthia Binder, requested to replace shingles and 4 windows on the rear of the structure. The windows are not visible from a public way. The existing are 2 over 2 and the applicant would like to replace those with 1 over 1 windows.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

- **426 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**

No applicant appeared. The request is to remove a single door and replace it in kind.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

Public Hearing opened at 4:05 P.M. by John Dowd, Chair.

No public statements were made.

Public Hearings:

CASE #FY14-02

Application by Helen Ryde and Kate Schiappa for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to reconstruct the original section of the structure with the addition of a full shed dormer on the rear and to construct a full second story on the 1980s addition at the property located at **9 Wareham Road, Provincetown, MA.**

The applicants request that this case be continued to the August 21, 2013 Public Meeting of the Historic District Commission as the project is in the process of being re-designed. The applicants waived the time constraints.

APPROVED John Dowd 1st Thomas Biggert 2nd

CASE #FY14-06

Application by Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates, Inc., on behalf of Edward Lee for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a dormer and install two skylights on the north elevation, construct a dormer and install two skylights, remove windows and replace with a 10' French wood door, reconfigure and add windows and a door on the east elevation at the property located at **9 Center Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Derik Burgess, on behalf of Mark Kinnane, and Stephen Porter, presented the application. The applicant seeks to construct a dormer on both the north and south sides of the structure, representing less than 50% of the total roof area. The dormers will be constructed in keeping with the architectural style of the original house as detailed in the submitted plans. An existing single door on the south/back elevation will be replaced with a four-panel sliding glass door. All the windows being replaced will be in kind.

Public Comment

No comments were heard from the public and there was 1 letter from an abutter in opposition to the application.

In light of the historical nature of this Greek Revival building, the Commission was neither in favor of adding dormers on the north and south sides nor in favor of the replacement of the single door on the south elevation with French sliding glass doors as proposed. A suggestion was made

to possibly construct a south side dormer farther east, behind the chimney, and to forego the north side dormer altogether. As for the sliding glass door, Commissioner Dowd stated that the Commission will sometimes allow windows to be replaced by doors that keep the same rhythm and that are trimmed out in a similar manner as the fenestration on that side of the building.

The applicant will revise the plans and continue to the next HDC Public Meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner John Dowd to continue Case #FY14-06 to the August 21, 2013 Public Meeting of the Historic District Commission with the applicant agreeing to waive all time constraints. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Polly Burnell. VOTE 5-0-0.

CASE #FY14-07

Application by Kenneth Johnson for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct an 8' by 20' addition to the west elevation, add a second floor, including a shed dormer on the north elevation and two doghouse dormers on the south elevation with window and door changes on all elevation at the property located at **4 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Chris Beasley and Ken Johnson presented the application. The building needs structural renovation as it is not structurally sound. Mr. Johnson's design was an attempt to architecturally integrate the structure with other buildings in the neighborhood, all the while keeping it as historical-looking as possible. The Commission did not approve of the applicant's previous design that showed a proposed mansard roof to match the main building on the property.

Public Comment

No comments were heard from the public and there was 1 letter from an abutter in opposition to the application and 1 letter of concern from an abutter about any disruption or hazard created during the construction process.

The Commission was concerned about the scale of the building because it was previously a small cottage/outbuilding and the applicant was trying to turn it into a house. The Commission discussed alternative designs with Mr. Johnson and Mr. Beasley. The Commission suggested simplifying the design, including changing the dog-house dormers to shed roofs to bring down the visual scale and changing the centrality of the door with one window flanking on each side to make that façade less formal and more asymmetrical. Other suggestions made by the Commission included the use of 2 over 1 windows to simplify the design, replacing the front door with a salvaged half-light door, using weathered shingles, installing a single window on the second floor and two windows on the first floor on the east elevation, installing one window on the second floor on the west elevation and installing 3 windows on second floor and two windows on the first floor of the rear elevation.

The applicant will submit revised plans at the August 21, 2013 Public Meeting.

A motion was made by Commissioner John Dowd to accept the proposal with the following changes: the two dog-house dormers on the south elevation will be changed to shed dormers, the front façade of the building will have two windows, a door and then one window, the north elevation will have three windows in the shed dormer and two windows below, the west elevation will have one window on top and one window and one door on the rear elevation, the windows will be 2 over 1, the front door will be a salvaged, half-light Provincetown door, the east elevation will have one window on the second story and two windows on the first story and the siding will be weathered shingles. All drawings will be revised by the architect and submitted to the Historic District Commission before the next meeting and reflect the drawing as initialed by Chairman John Dowd. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Ryan Landry. VOTE 5-0-0.

- Sean Curran of Phoenix Design and Development, Inc. for an informal discussion on proposed plans for 143 Commercial Street – Sean Curran and George Tagaris discussed the proposed project. Plans were submitted. Mr. Curran is looking for feedback from the Commission regarding the proposal. The property has two existing cottages in the rear and the foundation of a former building in the front of the lot. The proposal is to combine the two cottages, raise them to a story and a half, while retaining the cottage style design. The applicant seeks to keep the cottages separate visually but to connect them structurally. The intent of the renovations is to keep the structures in the spirit of the Town and adhere to the HDC guidelines.

Commissioner John Dowd stated that the applicants seemed to have addressed a lot of the concerns of the Commission, such as the fact that a one story building can be changed to a one and a half story structure, that waterside elevations have more leeway than elevations that abut the street. The proposed materials and windows for this project were in keeping with what has been used in buildings in the Historic District.

A motion made by Commissioner John Dowd to adjourn the August 7, 2013 meeting of the Historic District Commission at 5:40 P.M. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Polly Burnell. VOTE 5-0-0.

Respectfully submitted,
Ellen C. Battaglini