

# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

September 4, 2013

WORK SESSION 3:30 P.M.

## JUDGE WELSH ROOM

**Members Present:** Mr. David McGlothlin, Mr. Thomas Biggert, Ms. Polly Burnell and Ms. Marcene Marcoux (left at 5:10 P.M.).

**Excused Absence:** Mr. John Dowd, Mr. Lance Hatch, and Mr. Ryan Landry.

**Other Staff Present:** Mr. David Gardner (Assistant Town Manager) and Ms. Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator.

David McGlothlin called the Work Session to order at 3:46 P.M.

### Public Comments:

None.

### Administrative Reviews:

- **448 Commercial Street**

Installation of a fence.

**APPROVED**            Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup>            Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **39 Bradford Street, #4**

Replace railing and decking with new pressure-treated decking and railing.

**APPROVED**            Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup>            Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **226 Bradford Street**

Re-shingle three sides of house and replace shingles on front of house with clapboard.

**APPROVED**            Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup>            Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **541 Commercial Street**

Remove existing red cedar roof and install new roof. Replace two existing skylights and remove one skylight and fill in.

**APPROVED**            Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup>            Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **10A Commercial Street**

Remove one window not visible from a public way and replace with slider. Remove existing deck and replace. Remove existing fence and replace with white cedar.

**APPROVED** Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup> Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **579 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**  
Replace three failed windows in kind.

**APPROVED** Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup> Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- **64 Commercial Street**  
Replace front façade shingles with clapboard.

**APPROVED** Marcene Marcoux 1<sup>st</sup> Polly Burnell 2<sup>nd</sup>

- Proposed Bylaw revisions for Administrative Approval Process  
Discuss, review and vote to recommend proposed changes to the Administrative Approval Procedures as follows:

**15-7-5 Administrative Approvals:** If an application for a Certificate involves an Exterior Architectural Feature which is subject to review by the Commission under the provisions of the Bylaw, but the proposed Alteration clearly conforms to the purposes of this Bylaw and Guidelines and, therefore, is insubstantial in its affect on the District, this application shall be placed upon the next available meeting agenda, ~~with notice to abutters as provided in Section 7.3 for ratification. Ten (10) days shall elapse after the mailing of such notice before the~~ and may be approved by the Commission, or a sub-committee as appointed, as an administrative approval. ~~Commission may act upon such application and issue a Certificate.~~

David McGlothlin read the revision into the record. David Gardner reviewed the revision. This revision would eliminate the need for abutter notices for administrative reviews to be mailed out and would allow for sub-committee approval, expediting the processing of administrative approvals. The Commission discussed the revision.

*Commissioner Marcene Marcoux made a motion that the Historic District Commission accept the proposed by-law revision for the administrative approval process, 15-7-5 Administrative Approvals, and it will now read: 'If an application for a Certificate involves an Exterior Architectural Feature which is subject to review by the Commission under the provisions of the Bylaw, but the proposed Alteration clearly conforms to the purposes of this Bylaw and Guidelines and, therefore, is insubstantial in its affect on the District, this application shall be placed upon the next available meeting agenda and may be approved by the Commission, or a sub-committee as appointed, as an administrative approval'. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Polly Burnell. VOTE 4-0-0.*

**Public Hearing opened at 4:08 P.M. by David McGlothlin.**

**No public statements were made.**

## **Public Hearings:**

### **CASE #FY14-02**

**Application by Helen Ryde and Kate Schiappa** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to reconstruct the original section of the structure with the addition of a full shed dormer on the rear and to construct a full second story on the 1980s addition at the property located at **9 Wareham Road, Provincetown, MA**. This case has been continued to the October 2, 2013 Public Hearing.

### **CASE #FY14-06**

**Application by Mark Kinnane of Cape Associates, Inc., on behalf of Edward Lee** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a dormer and install two skylights on the north elevation, construct a dormer and install two skylights, remove windows and replace with a 10' French wood door, reconfigure and add windows and a door on the east elevation at the property located at **9 Center Street, Provincetown, MA**. This case has been continued to the September 11, 2013 Public Hearing.

### **CASE #FY14-08**

**Application by Derik Burgess of Cape Associates, Inc., on behalf of the Fine Arts Work Center** for a Certificate issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown for a Ratification of a previously-approved permit. The applicant sought Administrative Approval to remove and replace in kind 23 windows and 4 doors at the property located at **24 Pearl Street, Provincetown, MA**.

Commissioner Polly Burnell recused herself because of a conflict of interest.

Derik Burgess appeared to discuss the request. This case has already been approved administratively. The windows will all be 6 over 6, and the awning windows on the gable end facing the auditorium will be replaced in kind.

### **Public Comment**

No comments were heard from the public. There were no letters.

***Commissioner Thomas Biggert moved to accept as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Marcene Marcoux seconded VOTE 4-0-0.***

## **CASE #FY14-09**

**Application by John Yandrisovitz** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to renovate and enclose an existing porch structure into living area and extend a present sleeping loft over the new living room on the rear cottage. The proposed renovation is within the existing footprint at the property located at **5 Conant Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John Yandrisovitz presented the application. He seeks to enclosed an existing porch and extend a sleeping loft above. It is aesthetically pleasing and works with the existing structure. He seeks to improve his quality of life in the structure. The building materials to be used will be in accordance with HDC guidelines, including wooden cedar shake shingles, pre-stained gray, divided light windows and wooden trim and frieze boards. The sleeping loft will be a half story above the existing structure. The cottage is barely visible from Conant Street.

### **Public Comment**

Gary Vance, an abutter, spoke in support of the application.

Ms. Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator, informed the Commission they received six (6) letters in favor of the project.

**Letters in Favor: Johnny Pak, Gary Vance, Meryl Cohn, Mary Beth Caschetta, Paul Ditacchio & Marlene Sawyer.**

### **Commission Discussion**

The Commission was concerned about the height and the building mass of the structure and how that would change the streetscape view from both Conant Street and Atlantic Avenue. Commissioner Polly Burnell specifically mentioned Guideline 15 in regard to new construction and additions. The enclosure itself was not an issue, but the proposed size was of concern. The Commission suggested a compromise of enclosing the first floor, but keeping the second floor open.

The Commission gave Mr. Yandrisovitz the choice of proceeding to a vote, which would likely not be in his favor, or continuing the case and allowing him to revise the plans to address the issues of the Commission, including the height of the proposed second floor and the sliding glass doors. The applicant would like to redesign the project in light of the Commission's comments and continue to the next HDC meeting.

***A motion was made by Commissioner Polly Burnell to continue Case #FY14-09 to the September 18, 2013 Public Meeting of the Historic District Commission. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas Biggert. VOTE 4-0-0.***

## **CASE #FY14-10**

**Application by Scott William Grady, Architect, on behalf of Matt Marcotte** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the following changes: West elevation – add a new chimney, add a new balcony on the second floor, remove a deck and landing on the first floor and install French doors and add new windows. East Elevation – add a bay window bump-out. North Elevation – add new windows. Replace all existing windows and re-shingle the building located at **8 Washington Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Scott Grady presented the application and explained the proposed project. The applicants seek to open up the back of the house to the rear yard and make a modification to the ell at the end of the house where a cottage-like structure was added to the back. They also seek to maintain the painted white shingles on the front and replace the weathered shingles with new white cedar shingles and replace the asphalt-shingled roof with red cedar shingles. All existing windows will be replaced with like/kind windows and several windows will be added. One proposed alteration of the project includes the addition of a small bay window bump-out at the front of the structure that would attach to the ell and sit back from the main elevation. In the rear of the building, the project proposes to open up the back facade with the addition of two windows and French doors on the first floor to take advantage of a courtyard and to add French doors and a modest balcony on the second floor off the master bedroom. Another alteration proposes to raise the grade at the rear of the building with a landscape wall, build a screened porch to serve as a three-season room facing the rear courtyard and add a chimney in the rear to accommodate a fireplace in the porch. The applicants request to remove the left window on the south elevation, which is not in the application.

### **Public Comment**

No one spoke in favor or in opposition to the project.

Ms. Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator, informed the Commission they received four letters, all from abutters.

**2 Letters in Opposition: Edward Lehman and Marcie Hershman**

**1 Letter of Concern: Steve Amsden, Eric Schultz and Miriam Mandell**

**1 Letter of Support: Michael Istvanko**

### **Commission Discussion**

Some Commissioners questioned the suitability of the bay window bump-out on the east elevation shed addition, As to the south elevation, Mr. Grady added that he didn't think that shutters were appropriate for the windows on that side, adding that the applicant is requesting to remove the window on the left. The Commission was not in favor of the window removal and suggested that the window be converted instead to a shadow window. In regard to the north elevation, the Commission was concerned about the removal of a small window near the street

and the two windows on the second floor, preferring that the applicant leave the existing windows intact on that elevation. In addition, some Commissioners felt that the row of four small windows on the first floor was problematic, not historically accurate and were somewhat modern and suburban-looking. As to the west elevation, the Commission's comments were that the French doors, which are not historic, and the balcony on the second floor are an issue, as that part of the house can be seen from Law Street. The Commission had no issues with the second floor French doors and suggested that the applicant and Mr. Grady be more historically sensitive when the plans for the rear portion of the house are revised.

Mr. Grady requested a continuance to revise the project to address the concerns of the Commission. Two of the Commissioners stated that they would re-visit the site.

*A motion was made by Commissioner Polly Burnell to continue Case #FY14-10 to the September 18, 2013 Public Meeting of the Historic District Commission. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas Biggert. VOTE 3-0-0.*

### **Review and Approval of Minutes**

#### **August 7, 2013 Regular Session**

*A motion by Commissioner Polly Burnell to approve the minutes of the Historic District Commission, August 7, 2013 as presented. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas Biggert. VOTE 3-0-0.*

*A motion made by Commissioner Polly Burnell to adjourn the September 4, 2013 meeting of the Historic District Commission at 5:43 P.M. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Thomas Biggert. VOTE 3-0-0.*

Respectfully submitted,  
Ellen C. Battaglini