

# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

November 6, 2013

WORK SESSION 3:30 P.M.

## JUDGE WELSH ROOM

**Members Present:** Mr. John Dowd, Ms. Marcene Marcoux, Mr. Thomas Biggert and Ms. Polly Burnell (arrived at 4:00).

**Members Absent:** Mr. David McGlothlin, Mr. Lance Hatch and Mr. Ryan Landry.

**Staff Present:** Ms. Gloria McPherson, Town Planner.

John Dowd called the Work Session to order at 3:30 P.M.

**Public Comments:**

None.

**Administrative Reviews:**

- 235-237 Bradford Street: replacement of windows and installation of cedar siding over T111 on the north and west elevations.

**APPROVED 3-0-0**

- 199 Commercial Street, Unit #12: replacement of all windows on first floor beachfront side to match windows above and replacement of the three windows facing alley east with 3 double-hung windows

**APPROVED 3-0-0**

- 508 Commercial Street: replacement of first floor windows in kind; replacement and changes to slider, windows and doors.

Ms. Marcoux commented that any changes would have to come to the Commission as a full review as they are outside the scope of the administrative review process. She understands that there are questions about whether the proposed changes would be visible, but they are not a one-to-one replacement so the neighbors have a right to be notified. She stated that she would not want to set a precedent for this type of work being approved under administrative review.

The Commission discussed and agreed with Ms. Marcoux's assessment.

Mr. Dowd made a motion to accept the in-kind window replacements as presented for administrative approval, all other changes to require a full hearing. Ms. Marcoux seconded the motion. **The motion passed 3-0-0.**

- 67 Commercial Street: replacement of north facing wood door with a new wood door of similar style but different size.

The Commission discussed the application and determined that the proposed changes would require a full hearing. The Commission asked that the applicant provide additional elevations showing the entire building façade with the existing condition and the proposed changes.

- 4 Bradford Street, Building #2: review of final revised plans for previously approved case

**APPROVED 3-0-0**

- 555A Commercial Street: replacement of street side slider window in kind; addition of a new awning window on east side

The Commission **approved 3-0-0 the replacement of the slider window only.** The Commission determined that the addition of a new awning window would require a full hearing.

- 64 Commercial Street: replacement of two garage doors on the back of the building

**APPROVED 3-0-0**

- 409A Commercial Street: re-shingle north side of building with white cedar shingles in 5-inch courses

**APPROVED 3-0-0**

- Discussion on administrative review process for properties not visible or minimally visible from a public way:

Ms. Marcoux stated that the discussion surrounding 508 Commercial Street above covered this agenda item. The Commission agreed.

- The Commission reviewed a memo from Russell Braun, Building Commissioner. There was general agreement that Mr. Braun had made some excellent points. Ms. Marcoux stated that she would like to have some more time to respond to the memo. The Commission agreed and asked that Mr. Braun be present to discuss the memo at the next meeting.

### **Case# FY14-17**

**Application by George Tagaris of Phoenix Design** on behalf of Christopher J. Snow for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown for the property located at **143 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

The Commission reviewed final revised plans for this previously approved case. The Commission requested that the applicant add corner boards per an historic photo, and that the photo be attached to the approval.

**Public Hearing opened at 4:00 P.M. by John Dowd.**

Ms. Polly Burnell arrived at the meeting.

### **Public Hearings:**

#### **Case# FY14-02 (review revised plans)**

**Application by Helen Ryde and Kate Schiapa** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to reconstruct the original section of the structure with the addition of a full shed dormer on the rear and; construct a full second story on the 1980's addition at the property located at **9 Wareham Road, Provincetown, MA.**

Kevin Bazarian presented the revisions to the proposed project.

Mr. Dowd asked if there was anyone from the public who would like to comment.

There were no public comments.

Thomas Biggert thanked the applicant for working with the HDC, but questioned the proportions of the short, wide windows on the front façade.

Mr. Dowd commented that the proportions of the original windows, as shown by the windows to the left of the front door, was a square sash over a square sash, and thought that it would be appropriate for the new windows on the front façade to reflect that. The Commission discussed that other windows on the rear of the structure and on the new additions could be different.

The Commission discussed the trim details that remained on the structure, specifically the gable end trim and returns. They noted that the corner boards were currently vinyl, but that the original corner boards might be under the siding.

Ms. Burnell stated that per Guideline 15-11-2(b), any original trim should be kept and restored if necessary, rather than being replaced. This would apply to the gable end trim and original corner boards, if found.

The Commission requested that the applicant retain the exact gable end trim, eave detail and gable returns, providing details and cut-throughs, as well as photographs, to the Commission, and to mimic these details elsewhere on the structure, including on the newer addition. Mr. Dowd noted that the frieze trim board on the gable ends may be eliminated as it didn't seem to be a historically appropriate detail.

Ms. Burnell asked the applicant if the front door and opening was larger than the existing, as it appeared to be so, based on the elevation.

Mr. Bazarian responded that it is a new door so it was sized to meet new egress codes.

The Commission reviewed the plans and noted that there were other means of egress from the same living space so that the front door did not have to be enlarged as proposed.

***Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the proposal as revised and presented to the Commission, subject to the following conditions:***

- 1. The siding shall be clapboards on the south façade, with white cedar shingles elsewhere. (Guideline 12)***
- 2. The two windows that remain on the south façade to the left of the door shall be replaced in kind (same size and proportions; 2 over 2 sashes) and replicated on the three new windows on the south façade immediately to the right of the door and the two new first floor bedroom windows on the west elevation. (Guidelines 5a, b, and g)***
- 3. The door on the south façade shall remain the same size (width and height) as existing. (Guideline 6a)***

4. *The gable end trim and gable return on the west elevation shall be restored or, if too deteriorated, replaced in kind. This trim features shall be replicated elsewhere on the structure, including the newer additions.*
5. *The applicant shall provide the Historic District Commission with photos, architectural detail and cut-through of the existing gable end trim and gable return on the west elevation.*
6. *The frieze trim board on the gable ends may be eliminated.*
7. *The applicant shall provide the Historic District Commission with details of existing corner boards if found under the vinyl siding.*

*Mr. Biggert seconded. The motion passed 3-0-1, with Ms. Marcoux abstaining.*

#### **Case# FY14-19**

**Application by Kenneth Gregory** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to install eleven black solar panels on the west side of the roof at the property located at **6 Soper Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd opened the public hearing and asked for public comment.

Rachel White, neighbor, spoke in favor of the proposed project. She believes the applicant is very environmentally conscious and does not think the solar panels will be obtrusive or visible. She considers this to be a worthwhile project for the applicant and the town.

Mr. Dowd stated that he was in favor of the project.

Ms. Burnell stated that she was also in favor, noting that the panels would not be visible.

Ms. Marcoux stated that she believed this proposal is the perfect balance of being green and being considerate of where it is located, being sensitive to the historic nature of the building.

**Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted. Ms. Burnell seconded. The motion passed unanimously.**

#### **Case# FY14-20**

**Application by Peter Gherardi** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a dormer on the second floor north elevation, for the addition and replacement of various doors and windows on all elevations and for a 9' x 7'

garden patio of the east elevation at the property located at **15 Atwood Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd opened the hearing.

Peter Gherardi presented the project.

Mark Bouche introduced himself as the project manager.

Mr. Dowd asked for comments from the public. There were none.

Ms. Marcoux stated that she appreciates the quality of the application, especially the ¼-scale and the use of color photographs, which the Commission asks for. She stated that she is okay with the proposed project.

Ms. Burnell questioned the number of windows as well as the large size of the center windows in the dormer. She is concerned that it dominates the house. She read Guideline 5g.

Ms. Marcoux stated she thought the dormer and windows was intriguing and creative.

Mr. Gherardi noted that the large windows were in the dining room, which would tend to be dark without them.

Mr. Dowd noted that he believed the north elevation is a bit overwrought, with too many sizes and shaped of windows. He suggested that the applicant reduce the selection to just a couple window options that are the size and proportion of original windows in the structure, such as those on the west elevation.

The Commission discussed individual windows on the north elevation with the applicant in order to select appropriate sizes for each opening.

When the discussion turned to the large windows in the dormer, Mr. Bouche showed the Commission a photo of an abutting home with a dormer containing four evenly spaced 6/6 sash windows, which were slightly scaled-down in size from the windows in the main body of the house. The Commission agreed that this dormer and window treatment would be appropriate. Mr. Bouche agreed to come back with revised drawings showing a similar dormer.

***Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the south, east and west elevations as submitted, with the condition that the north elevation be revised as follows:***

- ***Proposed window AN321 shall be replaced with TN2646 (or the existing window may be retained) and a half sash window, maintaining the same spacing between windows as existing***

- *Proposed window TN2636 shall be replaced with TN2646*
- *Proposed window A2251 shall be replaced with 2 half sash, 6-light windows*
- *Dormer shall be revised to show four evenly spaced windows, slightly scaled-down in size from the TN2646 template window conditioned to be used elsewhere on the north elevation.*

*Mr. Biggert seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.*

#### **Case# FY14-21**

**Application by Bradford Center Condo Trust, Eric T. Secoy, Trustee** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove, replace and enlarge one skylight and add two new skylights on the west elevation, remove, replace and enlarge one skylight on the south elevation and remove, replace and enlarge one skylight on the east elevation at the property located at **162 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd opened the hearing.

Mr. Burnell stated that she would not be able to act on this application because the plans and drawings presented are not adequate for her to understand exactly what is being proposed.

Mr. Dowd stated that the skylights on the Bradford Street side would be very visible from the street. Replacing and enlarging skylights on the back of the building would be fine, but skylights on the street side detract from the historic character of the building when viewed from the street.

Ms. Marcoux stated that she thought replacing the existing skylights with the larger ones would be acceptable, but that adding two skylights to one of the existing, creating a bank of three skylights, is too much.

Mr. Biggert asked if they had thought about adding a dormer instead of the additional skylights.

Mr. Dowd agreed that would be preferable and more in character than adding skylights.

The Commission discussed the merits of dormers and skylights and generally agreed that in this case, a dormer would be preferable to three skylights, but that two skylights could be acceptable in principle. The Commission would need to see measured drawings before making that final determination.

Mr. Dowd requested that the applicant come back to the Commission with plans showing two skylights drawn to scale.

*Mr. Dowd made a motion to allow the replacement and enlargement as proposed of the skylight on the rear of the building. Ms. Marcoux seconded. The motion passed 3-0-1, with Ms. Burnell abstaining.*

#### **Case# FY14-22**

**Application by Derik Burgess of Cape Associates, Inc. on behalf of Phil Barber** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a shed dormer between two existing doghouse dormers on the side elevation at the property located at **21A Franklin Street, Unit #2, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd opened the public hearing and asked for public comment.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Dowd read three letters of support into the public record.

*Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Ms. Marcoux seconded. The motion passed unanimously.*

#### **Case# FY14-23**

**Application by Michael Czyoski on behalf of Paul Hastings** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval to replace two awning windows, replace two casement windows and install four new awning windows at the property located at **261 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd opened the public hearing.

There was no public comment.

Mr. Biggert stated that in theory, he liked the proposed changes, but he cannot approve the application without adequate drawings.

Ms. Burnell agreed with Mr. Biggert.

Mr. Dowd gave guidance to the applicant regarding the type of drawings with measurement that the Commission needs to make an informed decision. He stated that with hand drawn windows, it's not possible to determine what they will actually look like because they are not drawn to scale.

Mr. Dowd stated that if the applicant wanted to use the existing window to the left of the chimney as a template window for the replacement of windows and the addition of new windows, he would find that acceptable because the existing window is of a size and scale appropriate to the structure.

*Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the application subject to the condition that the applicant use double hung window TW2032, with 6 over 6 sashes, which matches the existing window to the left of the chimney, for all replacement windows and new window additions. Ms. Marcoux seconded. The motion passed 3-0-1, with Ms. Burnell abstaining.*

#### **Case# FY14-24**

**Application by Regina Binder on behalf of Gary Danko** for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicants seek approval for the following changes: South elevation: replace all windows with 2/2's and on the setback south portion replace a 1970's picture window and door with a French door; North elevation: no changes; East elevation: replace all windows with 2/2's, with transom windows to remain and; move door and portico to location of casement window keeping with neighborhood fenestration patterns and add two new windows in location of existing door; West elevation: replace 2/2 windows in kind, replace casement windows with 2/2 windows and replace a 1970's picture window with a casement window with an awning window below in the existing opening at the property located at **Zero Conway Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Ms. Ginny Binder presented the project, a portion of which had been approved administratively at a prior HDC meeting.

Mr. Chip Lemoine, the builder, was also present to answer questions.

Mr. Dowd asked for public comments. There were none. He then read written comments into the record.

Mr. Biggert stated that on the south elevation, he would prefer the door to remain.

Ms. Burnell noted that that part of the building is a modern addition and she didn't have an issue with what was proposed.

Mr. Dowd stated that the west elevation second story windows seem large.

Mr. Lemoine responded that the drawing is incorrect. The windows are supposed to be the same size as the windows on the south elevation.

Mr. Dowd asked what the railing system is going to look like, stating that he prefers the post to die into the building rather than be placed in front of the structure.

Mr. Lemoine stated that the railing is posts and wires, to set the newer addition off from the historic structure.

The applicants discussed with the Commission the siding choice, noting that they found shingles under the vinyl siding on the sides of the house.

***Mr. Dowd made a motion to approve the application with the condition that the second story windows on the west elevation be revised to be the same size as the windows on the south elevation. Ms. Marcoux seconded. The motion passed unanimously.***

Respectfully submitted,

Gloria McPherson