

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

December 4, 2013

REGULAR MEETING

3:30 P.M.

JUDGE WELSH ROOM

Members Present: Mr. John Dowd, Ms. Marcene Marcoux, Mr. Thomas Biggert and Mr. Lance Hatch.

Members Absent: Mr. David McGlothlin, Ms. Polly Burnell and Mr. Ryan Landry.

Staff Present: Ms. Gloria McPherson, Town Planner.

John Dowd opened the meeting at 3:30 P.M.

Public Comments:

None.

Administrative Reviews:

5 Winthrop Street – request to replace a garage door with a fiberglass door at the rear of the property and replace a 6’ sliding glass door on the second floor in kind.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve as submitted and seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

7 Carver Street – request to re-install a wood picket fence 2’ in height at the front of the property.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve as submitted and seconded by Marcene Marcoux. The motion passed unanimously.

378 Commercial Street – request to remove and replace remaining three windows that were not approved at the previous HDC meeting.

Mr. Dowd asked Dan Hoort, the applicant, what he intended to do with the existing Queen Anne windows noted as windows #18, 19 and 20 on the submitted photos.

Mr. Hoort replied that they were very drafty so he would like to put in 2 over 2 windows to match the rest of the exterior windows, then restore the Queen Anne sashes and install them on the inside as a decorative element.

Mr. Biggert noted that he counted a total of 9 Queen Anne windows.

Mr. Hoort stated that 7 were visible from a public way. He added that the sashes would be stripped down to natural wood, restored and hung inside the windows they were removed from.

Mr. Dowd asked about a frosted Queen Anne window he noticed.

Mr. Hoort replied that it was in a bathroom and that they were not planning to replace it at this time.

Mr. Biggert expressed a concern that the windows were becoming decorative elements that could be removed.

Mr. Hoort explained that they would be permanently affixed to the interior mouldings so no one could remove them.

Mr. Dowd suggested that wherever the Queen Anne sashes were affixed to the interior, that the new windows be one over one, so that the old sashes could be better seen through the new windows.

Mr. Hoort stated that the windows were already ordered, based on the prior HDC approval, but that he would check to see if the order could be changed.

Ms. Marcoux stated that the HDC approved the windows, but that there was an issue with the presentation at the last meeting, that the HDC was told they were a one-for-one replacement and no mention was made of the stained glass.

Mr. Hoort noted that they are not original to the house, but were a later change. The 2 over 2 windows were original and they were trying to bring that back. He noted that with the last round of window replacements they did in 2012, they had a variety of windows and sashes and they were all replaced, with HDC approval, with new 2 over 2 windows. He views this application is a continuation of the prior approved work.

Ms. Marcoux stated that the newer Queen Anne windows are still historic so still a concern of the HDC, but we can find a way to work it out.

Mr. Dowd thanked Mr. Hoort for doing the right thing and trying to bring the structure back to what the original photos showed. He noted that the Queen Anne windows are also important because it is good for historic districts to show the progression of different styles and design elements.

Mr. Dowd made a motion that the applicant should use one over one windows for replacing windows #14-20, if it is possible to change the window order at this time, with the Queen Anne windows restored and affixed to the interior. Motion passed unaniomously.

8 Cudworth Street (Case# FY14-30) – review of revised plans based on HDC conditions of approval

Motion made by John Dowd to approve as revised and seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

Minutes:

The Commission reviewed the Minutes of November 6, 2013.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the Minutes as written and seconded by Marcene Marcoux. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Dowd opened the Public Hearing portion of the meeting at 4:00 P.M.

Public Hearings:

Case# FY14-31: Application by Brian O’Malley for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the installation of two solar hot water collectors on the hip roof of the rear unit (one on the west elevation and one on the east elevation) at the property located at **410 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Robin Ryder-O’Malley was present to present the application to the HDC. He stated that the back roof where the collectors were proposed was not visible from Commercial Street, although one of the collectors would be visible from Dyer Street. He described the collectors as having a 4-inch profile and noted that the panels and all the tubing would be black.

Mr. Joel Harms, an abutter on Dyer Street, spoke in favor of the project.

Mr. Dowd stated that he has no problem with the project as proposed, that it is barely visible, and that he is always in favor of finding green solutions when they don’t distract from the Historic District.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the application as submitted and seconded by Marcene Marcoux. The motion passed unanimously.

Case# FY14-32: Application by Ted Smith for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add a shed dormer on the rear portion of the west elevation at the property located at **2 Winthrop Place, Provincetown, MA.**

Mr. Dowd stated that the application seemed self-explanatory and that the HDC generally allows dormers, especially in cases like this where it is at the rear of the building and barely visible.

Mr. Biggert added that this was what the HDC likes to see since it doesn't detract from the street presence.

Mr. Horace Stone, an abutter, stated that he believes his is the only property that will see the dormer. He spoke in favor of the project.

Members of the HDC read three written comments into the record. All were in support of the project.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the application as submitted and seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

Case# FY14-33: Application by A.J. Santos Construction, on behalf of Paul Richardson, for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove a 28" entry door with a French door at basement level on the west elevation, remove and relocate a window by 12" to the east on the north elevation, and add two support columns to the existing half center columns on the east street side elevation, repairs to existing deck and, replace all remaining existing windows in kind at the property located at **42 Pearl Street, Provincetown, MA.**

AJ Santos presented the project to the HDC.

There were no public comments.

Mr. Biggert asked for clarification regarding the location of the columns when moved.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the application as submitted and seconded by Thomas Biggert. The motion passed unanimously.

Case# FY14-34: Application by Ted Smith, Architect, on behalf of Tom Tannariello, for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace and add various doors and windows on all elevations; remove and replace the roof with a higher ridge roof, construct 3 dormers on the front façade and add a second story on the rear portion of the structure at the property located at 27 Watson's Court, Provincetown, MA.

Mr. Tom Tannariello presented the project to the HDC.

Mr. Ted Smith noted that the applicant was keeping the footprint the same and proposing less than what is allowed under the Zoning Bylaw. He added details to the project description, including that the roof was being raised 3 feet, from 18 ft to 21 ft by adjusting the roof pitch from 8:12 to 11:12 and that they were proposing to add 3 shed dormers and a covered entryway on the on the front façade. He stated that the Res 3 Zoning District allows 2 stories and the proposed change to the ell is essentially adding a story through the use of dormers. The house will still be 1 ½ stories, which is lower than what is allowed.

There were no public comments.

Members of the HDC read two written comments into the record. Both were in support of the project.

Mr. Biggert stated that he liked the shed dormers on the front façade. He is not in favor of the French doors on the south elevation, but recognizes that they are not visible from the street so they do not fall under the jurisdiction of the HDC. He questioned whether the Juliet balcony with the double door is visible, even if minimally.

Mr. Tannariello stated that he did not believe it was visible from the street. He explained that there was already a single door and prefers the double door since it brings in more light.

The HDC agreed that the doors of the Juliet balcony are not visible from a public way.

Mr. Dowd noted that the 19th century kitchen chimney in the rear ell is currently parged, but he believes it would be historically appropriate if the applicant wanted to redo it in brick.

Mr. Dowd stated that while he feels this is a good overall design, he is still a little sad that the town is losing another old, small-scale shack. He understands that the market drives these changes, but his primary concern is the character of the Historic District. He said this is an example of balancing the loss of something authentic for something less authentic but well done.

Ms. McPherson asked if it was appropriate to lose 2 of the 3 original window openings on the first floor, north side.

Mr. Dowd noted that there are 3 windows in the new dormer, which balances the 3 original windows. He thought that if there were 3 windows on the first floor as well, it would be too much.

Motion made by John Dowd to approve the application as submitted and seconded by Marcene Marcoux. The motion passed with 3 in favor, 0 opposed and Mr. Dowd abstaining.

At 4:36, Mr. Dowd made a motion to adjourn. The Motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Gloria McPherson
Town Planner