



Building Committee

Building Committee Meeting Minutes
 Monday, December 8, 2014 @ 5:00 pm
 Judge Welsh Room at the Provincetown Town Hall
 Called to Order: 500 pm

Membership:

P	E	U	Name	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Tom Coen, Chair	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Rick Murray, Vice Chair	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Don Murphy	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Kevin Shea	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Leif Hamnquist	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Sheila McGuinness, Alt.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Voting

(Note: P = Present E = Excused U = Unexcused)

These minutes are in brief format.

This meeting was filmed by Provincetown TV

Also Present:	
Tom Donegan, BoS Chair	David Gardner, Acting Town Mgr.
Erik Yingling, BoS Vice Chair	Michelle Jarusiewicz, Acting Asst. Town Mgr.
Robert Anthony, BoS	Dan Hoort, Finance Director
Cheryl Andrews, BoS	Jim Golden, Acting Police Chief
Raphael Richter, BoS	

Order of Business:
<p>1. Joint meeting with the Building Committee - Police Station Building Project Status Report. Discussion of the process for the Police Station and other Capital Projects.</p>
<p>2. Other matters that may legally come before the Committee not known at the time of posting. (Votes may be taken).</p>

Agenda Item 1. Joint meeting with the Building Committee - Police Station Building Project Status Report. Discussion of the process for the Police Station and other Capital Projects.

Tom Donegan asked Chairman Coen to give a brief history of what has happened over the past couple of years and where they are now with the project so that the three newly appointed members of the Board of Selectmen and the public have a better understanding. Tom Coen stated that the police station project predated the formation of the Building Committee close to 9 months or more. There was an assessment done on the existing police station in 2009 by a company from Florida at which time numerous shortcomings had been identified. In March of 2012 at the Town Meeting the initial proposal for a combined DPW/Police Station project costing \$14.5M had been poorly received. The proposal had been indefinitely postponed at that time and then the Building Committee was established in June of 2012. The following table summarizes the three formal proposals for a new police station, with design assistance and estimates from the firm of Kaestle Boos that Chairman Coen referred to:

Date:	February 24, 2012	January 20, 2013	October 16, 2013	Cumulative Change	% Change
Location	Race Point Road	Race Point Road	Jerome Smith Road		
Square Footage	17,280	14,600	13,615	-3,665	-21.2%
Estimated Total Project Costs	\$10,082,200	\$8,590,500	\$7,569,900	(\$2,512,300)	-24.9%

The first estimate, dated February 24th 2012, predates the formation of the Committee and reflects the costs for the police station alone, excluding the DPW Highway Maintenance facility. Kaestle Boos has advised us that the latest estimate (October 16th 2013) is already out of date and that we should expect costs to rise by approximately 3.5% per year. This means that if we defer putting the first shovel in the ground by one year, costs will rise by

approximately \$265,500. If we wait two years, they will increase by approximately \$540,700.

Regarding the requirements for the police station that drive the size of the building, the Committee conducted a workshop with the previous Board on September 17th 2013. The focus of the workshop was a preliminary design for a station at the former VFW site, for which the Board had already signed a purchase agreement.

At the end of the workshop the Board directed us, by a vote of 5-0, to meet three conditions to gain their support: 1) reduce the size of the building by 500 square feet or more; 2) reduce the footprint of the police station in order to maximize the portion of the site that would be available for affordable housing; and 3) to come up with a schematic design for affordable housing on the site. We did that by the middle of October of last year, but we haven't met since then so we haven't actually walked through that design but we were able to reduce the size down to 13,615 square feet at roughly a \$7 ½ million cost. Since then, I think we've been in a bit of a holding pattern since the turnover on the BOS and this is our first opportunity to meet with the new board. We'd like to understand where our baseline is, what do we agree on, and what are the issues we need to address so we can bring this to the next stage.

Tom Donegan thanked the committee for coming and asked Tom Coen to talk a bit about the evaluation of the current police station relative to the possible expansion and altering of the building and their recommendations.

Tom Coen stated that they had done an evaluation of the site but never took it as far as coming up with a building design due to the considerable number of shortcomings they felt would make it unsuitable. One of the shortcomings mentioned was the actual size of the lot. It would be very difficult to fit the size of the building being considered or even a smaller building on this site taking into consideration the need for secured parking as well. Another shortcoming of that site is the water table as it is in a Zone A flood zone. There was no engineering study done to see exactly where the water line would be. It would not support any below ground habitable spaces. Right

now the processing area, jail cells, animal control, and electrical equipment are all down below the water level. We would need to build up from where the potential flood water level would be. All of those areas now below the flood zone would have to be brought up to ground level. The limitations of the configuration of the two L- shaped lots would be difficult to group functions appropriately so that the public level of entrance would be at grade. If we used this site it would have to be raised above the first level and would have to put all of the ADA compliant ramps accordingly. In addition, you would have to temporarily relocate the Police Dept. We cannot rent portable jail cells you have to buy them. The cost at the time ranged somewhere between \$750,000 to \$1M to temporarily relocate for about 18 months. There would be no tangible gains at the end of this project on the expenditures invested. The FinCom came to relatively the same conclusion primarily based on the cost of temporary relocation.

Don Murphy pointed out that you would be unable to get in and out of the building once you have lifted it up because you would be surrounded by water.

Tom Donegan gave a quick update that the BOS had been working over this summer on negotiations on an abutting piece of property to the Jerome Smith Road location that will alleviate some of the egress and entrance problems that were experienced in the last meeting with the Building Committee. If the negotiations come to fruition and Town Meeting approves the purchase that will provide us with more flexibility given the small amount of street frontage of the Jerome Smith lot. It will give residents a way out onto Winslow Street. We think the negotiations will come to completion but there are still many steps yet that need to happen. It will change the dynamic of the lot for the positive and provide for a better opportunity for the co-development of municipal and housing units which was the original idea for this purchase. He asked to start with any questions so that everyone could come to a common understanding.

Raphael Richter thanked the committee noting that it had been a long, long process and that the entire Town appreciates everything the committee has done so far. He wanted to know if the Parking Dept. could be moved out of

the existing plans noting that there is space at Town Hall or perhaps downtown sites where they could function. He asked the committee or the Police Chief to speak on why the Parking Dept. needs to be at Police Station.

Chief Golden stated that the administrative functions of that department could be located anywhere, but there would still be an enforcement component that would need to operate out of the police station. There are meter enforcement staff that work beyond the normal business day; until midnight in the summer and on the weekends. There would need to be a location for them to come in and get their equipment and take care of their other responsibilities. The Town Hall or VMCC probably would not be the right locations for nighttime hours. He said that culturally people always come to the police station to deal with their tickets. It would be a big shift to have to tell everyone that they need to go to the VMCC. It can be done, but to be able to maintain our being visitor friendly we need to aware that anyone who gets a ticket after 3pm in the afternoon the first place they go is to the police station.

Raphael Richter asked how much of the 13,000 square footage presented in the committee's last proposal was for the Parking Dept. Tom Coen did not know the exact amount but noted it is quite a small space; perhaps around 250 square feet. Don Murphy commented that they have a complete set of plans for BOS to look at which should answer some of the questions.

David Gardner told the BOS that the question is being looked at, at the administration's level not at the police department's level. The administration has been generally evaluating that, as the Chief mentioned, in terms of the functioning within the Parking Dept. He agreed with the Chief's assessment that administration and enforcement are two separate things. The amount of square footage that is dedicated for each or either of those is pretty insignificant in terms of the overall. Sheila McGuinness commented that it is in the less expensive footage of the building because it is just office space as opposed to the more expensive areas so that by reducing that small amount would be a small savings.

Raphael Richter spoke about the use of the Jerome Smith lot and the lot that is in negotiations at present being used for housing since this may be one of the last opportunities we have to do so. He wanted to know if it was feasible to see a plan where the police station could potentially be located below with the housing located above it. He encouraged the committee to think about whether that could be feasible and return at a future time with this information.

Don Murphy asked for help in understanding what Raphael Richter meant by feasible; was he saying that for example if the building was three stories high that the first two stories would be for the police station and then the third floor would be housing for the elderly?

Raphael Richter stated that it would not necessarily be for the elderly; in a broad sense it would be for the community. Don Murphy commented that it would be possible to do it, but asked if they wanted residents over the police station. Raphael Richter said that could be a possibility but that would be a decision to be made down the road and a lot of this has to do with us getting the parcel next to it.

Tom Coen commented that this has come up before and to him it seems like an odd pairing of uses within a single building. He has looked but could not come up with any examples. If anyone comes up with examples it would be interesting to take a look at it. It is easier to imagine it in an urban environment where you are talking about a police substation within a building that has other commercial tenants with apartments located above. He was trying to envision how that would look in a non-urban environment such as Provincetown.

Don Murphy has an engineering background and knows that you put together plans based upon requirements. Spending time and money to create a model might not be determined the best way to go. He suggested that the requirement be presented first and the work would then not be wasted. Be careful not to do things on an experimental basis because that costs money and causes delays. He recommended using the round table discussions which he thinks are absolutely great.

Raphael Richter will try to help the committee get what they need. He has a concern as to what the town can afford. He is not ready nor does he have the expertise to say \$5 or 6 million is the number, but \$7.5M is still a lot of money for the town to absorb today and even in three years. We want to be able to present a police station to the public that we can get a positive vote on while continuing to meet our needs. He thinks that \$7.5M is going to be a tough sell.

Don Murphy has had these discussions before and what you need is a complete set of plans that represent what the \$7.5M will have in them. Cross out what you don't want until you come to the amount of money you want to spend. Vote amongst yourselves to see what you need.

Tom Coen recommended that the three new members on the BOS become familiar with what the other BOS already know. Go to other police stations and come back and look at the Provincetown police station. After that sit down and go through the plans. The committee did that last year. An architect came in and walked the footage with them. Those departments that they visited invited them to come again and revisit. It was helpful for them as a Building Committee. You have to remember that time is money. The longer you put it off the more it is going to cost.

Tom Coen suggested that we visit other Police Stations to see how they work. Then, go thru the plans and see what you wish to change. He stated there is no substitute to seeing Harwich, Truro, Chatham, and then Provincetown again. They will invite us again. Time is money. Wellfleet just got a renovation estimate, and it includes an escalator of 7.8% a year.

Don Murphy spoke on the calculation being based on the selling of the existing police station. When talking about this before, the revenue from the existing police station would have been applied toward the new police station. He asked Raphael Richter if he was using that model when he made reference to his concerns about the cost.

Raphael Richter said no. He does not envision selling any of the parcels off. He agrees that there is a value in the property.

Don Murphy suggested that any money from either the sale of the existing police station or placement under another department within the town should be applied to the new police station. This would be accomplished through the internal accounting system within the town should the old police station not be sold but given to another department for its use.

Cheryl Andrews disagrees politically. They would have to explain to the School Dept. why they did not sell the VMCC to pay for the high school renovation. She told the committee that it was nice to see all of them as this was the first chance to meet with them since being back on the BOS. She told the committee that if they were frustrated she could understand that. She compared the sewer project to this project in hopes that this was not offensive to them; but stated that any municipal project has starts and stops and starts and stops. When something gets done she knows there will be something exciting to put their name on. For all the money that was spent and all of the plans for the sewer project that were done she learned that it was not science that gave them the answer; science was a part of it. It was science, politics and finance. They had to juggle all of those. Several years later she was reminded that she had wanted to put in the 1 million gallon sewer but they had gone with the ½ million gallons. She stated that you cannot cut out politics or choice. She told the committee that she realized that they will have a bit of frustration and that she appreciates all the work they have done so far. The new members of the BOS will be asking some of the same questions the committee has heard before as well as some new questions. Should the committee get frustrated she hopes they will call her or any of the BOS because it is going to be this year and next that the BOS are going to be asking many of the same questions. People may be coming up with new ideas they have never come up with before. Even if the BOS has to deal with an escalator; they have to get it right. Let us do this right and when we go upstairs we will all vote and everyone cheers and the golden shovels come out. She stated she was here to help achieve that goal. In preparing for tonight she went online to review the Building Committee minutes. She saw the plans for across the highway and knows what they look like and has

briefly seen that plans for the VFW site. She asked the committee to put together a memo for the BOS and let them know which videos/materials they can read/watch so she can educate herself. The committee has talked about the Shank Painter site and she has never seen nor read anything about those plans. Also, plans for the VFW. If those are in digital that is fine but if not she would need to see something. She asked the committee to stay with the BOS for potentially a new charge. A cost number all on its own should not drive this; square footage, land use, attributes, dollar number all of that. She wanted to start working that with the committee and hopes that the answer is not what Don said and just hand the BOS a plan and a pencil and just start cutting. The committee has 2 ½ years of experience with this project and she probably never will have. So if the BOS asks the committee to show them a concept model that is done differently and has a different price tag the committee is in a much better position to say what it would look like. She has no experience in that area and would not know how to do it.

Don Murphy - On September 17, 2013, meeting with the BOS was when this presentation was made on all these issue. The Chief from Harwich was at that presentation. He came down and answered some of these questions. He has built three police stations. He has offered to come back again anytime to go over some of those issues. He is 100% in favor of the round table discussions. He will start all over again, if you want to but keep in mind that those plans are your points of reference.

Cheryl Andrews wanted to know which would be better to review; paper or digital form. Don Murphy will give her the paper and then she can watch the presentation.

Tom Donegan to Cheryl Andrews - she might visit either Harwich or Chatham. Chatham is a better example as it is more basic and of similar size. Don Murphy stated that Chatham will say that they have more space than they need. Tom Coen said that Chatham is just a police station and Harwich is a police/fire station. Tom Donegan felt like Provincetown would wind up looking more like Chatham.

Cheryl Andrews commented that maybe they should look in a different area. She has been goggling over the past few days looking online. She goggled, "How do you size a police department" and "How do size a police station." If somebody does find a police station that seems to look a little more like what would be appropriate she wants to know.

Eric Yingling thanked that committee for being here and is looking to moving forward. He agrees with what the committee outlined. He spoke about the possible downsizing in the number of desks needed as many of the staff are out in the field and desks could be used by other staff as well.

Jim Golden - Yes, and I think most of that, has been factored in. We compartmentalize this into detention, operations and administration.

Erik Yingling mentioned that perhaps a substation would help to reduce the cost of the project. It would make sense to have a substation downtown since that is where the officers are most of the time. He is trying to find inexpensive ways.

Tom Coen - Barnstable is the only town on the Cape with substations and this past September they opened one in Osterville. These substations are mainly to have a presence but police also do administrative work. .

Don Murphy again suggested that BOS and staff go and look at Harwich and Chatham, talk to each Chief and ask them shy their set-up works for them. The logistics in each building is different. For example, a roll call room must be secure as they coordinate their daily activities to take into the streets; there are things on the wall. This is not a room that could easily be shared. Eric Yingling: Can the building be multi-purpose? This would be very positive for our community. He is looking forward to going through this again; the BOS will sit down, go through plans and requirements and see if it affects any laws.

Bobby Anthony thanked the committee for sticking together through all of the ups and downs. He is totally in favor of a new station. He has been through some of these ups and downs and knows what the building is all

about. As a BOS there are some fiscal responsibilities that are required as well as the need for a lot more communication as to what the building is to look like. Brewster built a brand new beautiful station. A lot of thought went into it. Brewster should be one of the stations we concentrate on. There was a one time a lot of money available for these stations being built; that money has dried up. We will look at our plans, what is necessary, and if there is any excess we will have to cut it out. We are moving ahead. He will give the committee his support.

Tom Donegan thanked the Board for coming and letting the BOS field questions. He showed them the CIP and commented, "...pay attention to the dimes and the dollars will take care of themselves". When coming to the Cape as a washashore he noted that the Fairfax County building had the housing in front, the Police Dept. in back and the middle area utilized by the community. It is a good idea to have a jointly developed building looking at higher usage. At present, we have a police station that is surrounding by a church and other housing. The Winslow property will accommodate housing and a police station with more of a shared cost. Pumps and generators will all be shared.

We need to look at what are the requirements for the jail cells, the need when you factor in the Barnstable County bus or paddy wagon that's comes during carnival and 4th of July.

Tom Coen - we got rid of the padded cell. It is just a space for a reclining chair that people are strapped to for their own safety. This space does not require a cell.

Tom Donegan - limit the number of desks and have modern digital to create no paperwork storage needed.

Tom Coen you will be sadly disappointed at amount of paper police are still mandated to retain. They are as efficient as possible.

Tom Donegan - we need to understand how it is done; where it is done poorly and then determine what we can build. Answer questions and have a

sense of what kind of cost decisions need to be made for doing this or that. Should we build out or build up; let's have a ballpark. The BOS want to be able to show this to the public. We need another session to go through the plans. We will look at police stations that have been constructed in MA since we began this process; some in smaller towns in the western part of MA.

Don Murphy has been talking to people at the police station that was built in Dighton to get some understanding as to what they are going through.

Tom Donegan - Perhaps BOS/staff can walk around at the MA Municipal Association's Conference being held in Boston and view those exhibits on display by top engineering firms to get a better understanding of how things are working. This conference is being held the third week in January. Tom Donegan agrees with former Selectman John Santos that the business office part of the Parking Dept. belongs in a different place; whether at Town Hall or the VMCC. This needs to be rethought.

Erik Yingling is looking for a presentation like the DART presentation that was recently put together. Tom Coen was very impressed what DART did. They emphasized density which is very important in keeping it cost effective. Joining the two properties together; the traffic issues, particularly the Fire Dept.'s issues in having access and egress were well addressed. I do have concerns about the footprint of the police station as shown.

Erik Yingling - If we get Winslow farms that would be the way to look at it as DART did theirs.

Tom Donegan asked for any comments or questions and stated that the BOS would like to schedule a follow-up in January. The BOS and Committee will arrange to go to other towns and Tom Donegan, Tom Coen, & David Gardner will investigate and set a schedule for early in January. The next meeting will take place later January.

Tom Coen - should we arrange before or after we go to other towns?

Tom Donegan - after going to the towns. Tom Donegan, Tom Coen, & David Gardner will get together to discuss.

Cheryl Andrews asked the Committee to drop the BOS a memo and run through all the police stations between here and Hyannis. She wanted to know why the Committee recommended certain police stations to visit and not others, such as the smaller towns like Wellfleet.

Tom Coen: the Committee did not make any recommendations; those were made by the Chief. David Gardner: we went for the newest police stations on the cape, at the time.

Cheryl Andrews knows Chatham and Harwich and can't imagine what they have in common with Provincetown. She is also familiar with Barnstable as well as having nothing in common. Tom Donegan suggested that perhaps the BOS may find a police station in a smaller town in either southeastern or western MA that would be worth seeing.

Tom Donegan appreciated the Committee's efforts and hoped that the Committee understood that a part of the reason for the delay is in getting everyone together and part of it having to do with the negotiations with the abutter's property that will give us an enormous amount of flexibility to make the Jerome Smith site work for the town as well as helpful for people to understand what we are doing when they look at it.

Agenda Item 2. Other • Other matters that may legally come before the committee not known at the time of posting. (Votes may be taken).

(None).

List of documents reviewed:

- 1. June 23, 2014 Status Report to the Board of Selectmen*

Next Meeting:	TBD
Adjourn:	6:07 pm
Minutes by:	Loretta Dougherty / Tom Coen

Approved by  on June 25, 2015
Thomas Coen, Chair