

**TOWN OF PROVINCETOWN - BOARD OF SELECTMEN  
MEETING MINUTES  
FISCAL BUDGET MEETING  
WEDNESDAY - JANUARY 06, 2016 – 6:00 PM  
JUDGE WELSH ROOM - 260 COMMERCIAL STREET**

Chairman Thomas Donegan convened the open meeting at 6PM noting the following attendees: Board of Selectmen members: Tom Donegan, Erik Yingling, Cheryl Andrews, Raphael Richter, and Robert Anthony.

Other attendees: Town Manager David Panagore, Assistant Town Manager David Gardner, Finance Director Dan Hoort, Fire Chief Michael Trovato, John Thomas CEO and Treasurer Steven Roderick of Outer Cape Ambulance Services, Harbormaster Rex McKinsey, Interim Building Commissioner Anne Howard, Town Planner Gloria McPherson, Police Chief Jim Golden, and Director of Health & Environment Morgan Clark.

Recorder: Loretta Dougherty

**1. Public & Selectmen Statements** – No statements.

**2. FY2017 Overall Budget Review Inclusive of the following**:

**Division III Budget Review**:

**A. Public Safety– Fire**:

**220 Fire – Fire Chief (\$750,866)**:

Fire Chief Mike Trovato stated that the biggest increase is in the “A” budget due to contractual personnel raises. They are looking to increase [A-3] the Rescue stand-by from 165 days of coverage to 170 days which will cover us from May 15<sup>th</sup> through October 31<sup>st</sup>. Previously there has been \$10,000 budgeted for this program. They are asking for \$15,000 due to the many calls in the off season. They have been over spending around \$2,000 or \$3,000 over the last couple of years. He stated that salaries for EMT’s will be increased from \$23.99 to \$24.71; EMT-1 from \$25.82 to \$26.60 and Paramedic’s from \$28.27 to \$29.12. These are the two biggest increases in the “A” Budget. Including the smaller increases in the “A” Budget the total increase is \$35,003. The only “B” budget increase is for Repair & Maintenance on Vehicles [B-16] by \$5,000. This brings the total increase to \$40,003 (5.63%) for the 220 Fire Budget.

Cheryl wanted to know why some of the increases for personnel in the “A” budget were higher than others.

Mike stated that they had looked at the amount of time put in by each person. He stated that personnel are putting in a lot more time-wise than they are getting paid for but they are trying to bump things up slowly. They have kept it as conservative as possible trying to make it fair for everyone.

Raphael stated that the budget looks pretty strong but he has some broader questions that he believes he has asked Mike in the past. He stated that last year Mike had felt we had a decade of good solid volunteer force. Raphael asked him if he still felt the same this year, at this point. Mike stated that it seems to be going that way. He has picked up some new people that want to go to the Fire Academy. He stated that it is really hard to predict, but that he would say at least six years, hopefully more.

David P. asked the Chief to bring up the impact to Provincetown if the closure of the Barnstable Fire Academy were to happen.

Mike stated that right now the academy is open. He has spoken with Paul Tucker who was the Chief in Dennis for many years and is involved in the Fire Academy also. The pollutants that everyone is talking about were found in the ground, not the equipment. The chemical they found is used in jet fuel, in the chemical used to de-ice planes, and in clothing. The Fire Academy has not used any foam in at least 15 years. At the Barnstable County Fire Chiefs' meeting this was explained to Barnstable County Commissioner Sheila Lyons who was in attendance at the meeting.

David P. stated that right now the academy is open. He asked the Chief to explain what will happen if it should close.

Mike stated that firefighters 1 & 2 get monthly training two nights a week and one Saturday for a cost of \$180, at the academy. If the academy were to close the closest training available would be in Stow, MA, and they would have to go there for a whole month. It would be a hardship on those volunteer firemen who are in need of training but also have to hold down a full-time job. If the Fire Academy were to close it would have a huge impact on us.

Cheryl asked Mike if he had seen anything in writing that there had been testing done and nothing was found. The newspaper stated that the pollutants had been found but nothing about testing having been done. She stated that the issue this past summer was that someone had brought something in that was banned. She stated that it is a bigger problem than just the pollutants and we need to keep an eye on Barnstable County to make sure the academy is being managed properly and is not being closed due to something that someone else is doing. She asked that if anyone gets any information on this issue to please let the BOS know.

Tom stated that from what he understands it is the Town of Barnstable that would like to see the academy gone.

Raphael stated that it appears there are a number of pressures coming against the Fire Dept. within the next decade as it relates to personnel, and he thinks it would be wise for us to start planning for it now. He would like to see us have some idea by projecting what it would cost to staff a Fire Dept. in Provincetown. We could present it to the voters as part of a general presentation. He stated that he feels, along with others, that this is one of the lower hanging fruits for regionalization.

Mike interrupted Raphael and stated that he would like to have a conversation about this and did not appreciate him stating that the Fire Dept. is a lower hanging fruit. He stated that our Fire Dept. is one of the best and that we have nothing to gain by regionalization with Truro. He stated that it is a long stretch of highway from Provincetown to Wellfleet. WE have a first class fire department, first class equipment and we are not going to save any money by doing a regionalization with Truro.

Raphael stated that we have not seen any numbers to support that, respectfully. He thinks that it is all just opinions now and we need to have some real data to support it.

Mike stated that he believes he has been around long enough to tell him that we still need a certain number of people to answer rescue calls and a certain number of people for fires. At this point, the Fire Dept. can get three ambulances on the road to the hospital and still have a Fire Dept. left. He stated that before you start thinking about regionalization you need to think about how you are going to fund it.

Raphael stated that the idea is to get the discussion going as there is a lot of support for regionalization and, in general, it does in fact save money for a community.

Cheryl stated that it does for paid fire department; which we do not have.

Raphael stated that there is going to be a point, in the future, when Provincetown is going to need a paid Fire Dept. The pressures that are pushing on this community are going to force it. It would be unwise for us, as a community, to not plan for that. No disrespect for our fire department, they have done an amazing job and will continue to do an amazing job but at some point there is just not going to be the people to fill the positions, and if the Fire Academy shuts down then we are going to be in a much more dire position sooner rather than later. As policy makers, Raphael believes that it is their job to instruct staff to help the BOS start planning for what could be an inevitability that could be even sooner than six or ten years. He thinks that this is the time, during the budget discussion, to bring this up. He stated that it is not a reflection on the fire department. The Board is hearing all the time that we should be looking for opportunities for regionalization. He personally believes that we should as well. Raphael stated that he does not understand the specifics of what Mike is presenting as to why it should not go on, but he certainly wants to hear. Raphael stated that he wants it to be known that he would like us to seek opportunities for making major changes to the fire department, and if we were to do that, it is the time to think about opportunities for regionalization. He stated that this is looking out over the next ten years, and that it is not a part of this budget, but is the time to talk about it.

Mike stated that one of the reasons he wanted to start paying his firefighters by the call is that as long as we have Lower Cape Ambulance here and we can keep that privatization on one side and the fire department on the other side, it is going to continue to save us a lot of money whether it is ten years down the road or whether it is tomorrow. He stated that if we had a full-time Fire Dept. right now we would need a minimum of 12 people just to get the ambulances out the door, and then probably another 19 in there to respond to a fire.

Raphael stated that he is hoping, as part of this broader discussion of “what if” in the future, we have an idea within the next year for a real plan of what we are going to do and what the costs are associated with it.

David P. stated that he and the Chief have not had an extended conversation but he believes there has to be factored into the conversation the response times, the number of facilities and the area covered. He does think, based upon his experience, that there are cost savings but, at the same time, when you deliver services at a given location you have to have the people show up there. He thinks it is a complex question and should be answered. He wants to factor in all of the concerns that the Chief has leaving nothing out when they think about how best to position the Town even if it is 20 years from now.

Tom stated that to Raphael’s credit when they attended the Selectmen’s meeting it was stated that regionalization will happen and that you can either make it happen or it will happen to you. He stated that Raphael’s intention, as is the rest of the Board’s, is to be a leader in this to make it happen.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 220, in the amount of \$750,866.**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Cheryl Andrews**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**Fire Capital Improvement Program:**

Finance Director Dan Hoort stated that the CIP has not changed since the last time the BOS saw it.

David Panagore stated he has received no definite answer regarding the forward movement for the replacement of the radios. This request is just asking for an authorization; not a definite expenditure.

Tom stated that the replacement of the radios should be a Fall Town Meeting issue instead of a Spring Town Meeting

Mike stated that the Fire Deputy is working on a grant for this.

Robert wanted to know what we will be buying.

Police Chief Golden stated that Motorola is recommending that a community should be buying radios that are able to be flashed. The existing radios are operating at analog now which is scheduled to be turned off at some point and all radios will then go digital. E.F. Johnson and Motorola are the only two companies offering the digital equipment. The public safety radios are very sophisticated; they have inter-operability. These radios will be needed within the next three years for sure.

Cheryl asked if BOS approves the CIP, as presented, would the entire amount be bonded.

Dan stated that \$1.5 million will be bonded.

Robert stated that he is in favor of anything we need for public safety. However, he does not want to go out and buy the radios and have it change in two or three years due to new technology.

**231 Ambulance Service –Treasurer, Lower Cape Ambulance (\$830,239):**

John Thomas CEO and Steven Roderick, Treasurer of the Lower Cape Ambulance Service appeared before the Board. Mr. Roderick stated that there is a 2.4% increase. They will be replacing both of the ambulances, and purchasing the electric stretchers.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 231, in the amount of \$830,239.**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Robert Anthony**

A brief discussion was held looking at the history of the budget; they have increased their crew of 4 to 5; housing all people at the station in order to maintain 24 hour a day coverage. They hope to be collecting 85% to 90% of what they charge. It has been consistently going up even though they respond to a lot of situations that do not require transports. It is a 70/30 split for allocating between Provincetown and Truro.

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**B. Public Safety – General:**

**295 Marine – Harbormaster (\$195,000):**

Harbormaster Rex McKinsey stated that the budget is level funded for FY2017 based upon the amount approved by the Board last year. There was a brief discussion regarding the Pier’s rent abatement for \$118,000 as stated in the approved MOU. Rex asked that this issue be kept separate from the Harbormaster’s budget. It was determined that the abatement was included in the MOU for the FY2017 budget. The vote by the Board is just to approve the 295 budget.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 295, in the amount of \$195,000.**

**Motion: Cheryl Andrews**

**Seconded: Raphael Richter**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**250 Community Development Support – Assistant Town Manager (\$84,127):**

Asst. Town Manager David Gardner stated that this budget is different this year due to the reorganization within departments and divisions. This reorganization was done late in the budget process. The 250 budget represents administrative support. The “A” budget represents union salary increases and the hiring of a part-time seasonal code enforcement person whose salary would be revenue neutral and offset by the additional fees collected. Non-compliance for

rental fees will be doubled if owners are found to not have their certifications current. The “B” budget is level funded.

**MOTION:** Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 250, in the amount of \$84,127.

**Motion:** Erik Yingling

**Seconded:** None on this motion.

Cheryl asked for an amendment to the motion.

**MOTION:** Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 250, in the amount of \$84,127, with the understanding that the Asst. Town Manager will provide a written monthly report to the BOS updating us on the new part-time Compliance Officer’s activities, hours, and compliance issues.

**Motion:** Cheryl Andrews

**Seconded:** Robert Anthony

A brief discussion was held as to when this person would start. If no one is hired by spring, the report will simply say that we do not have anyone yet. A Special Town meeting was requested.

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**MOTION:** Move that the Board of Selectmen ask the Town Manager and Asst. Town Manager to identify the approach to be taken at a Special Town Meeting for hiring of a Compliance Enforcement Officer.

**Motion:** Robert Anthony

**Seconded:** Raphael Richter

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**251 Building Department – Building Commissioner (\$191,668):**

The overall budget decreased by \$10,423. Acting Building Commissioner Anne Howard stated that this budget was put together before she took over her current position. She stated that after reviewing the budget she would caution the town that the amount requested for education and books has been funded low.

**MOTION:** Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 251, in the amount of \$191,668.

**Motion:** Raphael Richter

**Seconded:** Erik Yingling

A brief discussion was held regarding changes coming down the pike with the possible new legislation on AirBnBs; occupancy taxes on short-term rentals. We should be prepared to have a refined rental certificate in place listing all the necessary inspection criteria required for all new rental establishments.

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**252 Planning & Development – Town Planner (\$179,173):**

Asst. Town Manager David Gardner stated that this budget includes the Town Planner, Permit Coordinator, and the Conservation Agent/Environmental Planner. The Conservation Agent was previously under the Conservation Commission budget; it was not an appropriate place for a staff member to be under a town board’s budget. The “A” budget increased by \$40,285. The “B” budget increased by \$1,875.

**MOTION:** Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager’s recommended budget for Dept. 252, in the amount of \$179,173.

**Motion:** Raphael Richter

**Seconded:** Erik Yingling

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

Without objection Tom stated that 253 Health Dept. will be taken out of order so that the Chief of Police can do all of his budget items together.

**253 Health Department – Director (\$233,159):**

Health Director Morgan Clark appeared before the Board. There is an overall increase in the budget of \$120,580 mostly due to the new Case Manager Services position.

A brief discussion was held regarding the partnership with Barnstable County on contracted services, and Erik stated that the budget as it stands for contracted services makes sense.

Tom agrees that this contracted service makes sense.

Erik asked if the smoking cessation program was going to take place.

Morgan stated that she hopes to be able to do it.

Tom suggested that Morgan check with the state health dept. because he believes there is industry money through the tobacco companies that might be available.

There was a brief discussion regarding the RFP that had been released around Christmas for the Case Manager Services previously approved by Town Meeting for \$50,000.

Cheryl is not in support of this; she realizes that there is a justification for this, but has not heard it. Tom explained how this amount was decided upon and that it was felt that this position would be better contracted out rather than having another town employee. This position would not necessarily be just for one person but it could be for a group of people.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager's recommended budget for Dept. 253, in the amount of \$233,159.**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Erik Yingling**

**4/1/0 (Cheryl Andrews) Motion passed.**

**291 Emergency Management – Chief of Police, Director of Health & Environment (\$12,060):**

Chief Golden presented the 291 budget. The overall budget increased by \$3,150. This was due to a \$900 increase for line item B-1 for shelter projects; a \$250 increase for line item B-2 for training, and a \$2,000 increase for line item B-3 for actual shelter supplies. We provide the location for the shelter but Truro has bought most of the equipment for the shelter over the last two years including a stationary storage container along with upgrades to the container.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager's recommended budget for Dept. 291, in the amount of \$12,060.**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Robert Anthony**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**C. Public Safety – Police:**

**210 Police – Chief of Police (\$2,563,936):**

Police Chief Golden appeared before the Board. The overall FY2017 budget increase is \$89739. The Chief wants to do more community policing events. He would like to have a larger presence and do anything to get our police officers in the room with members of the community. Erik asked about the increase for overtime.

The Chief stated that he staffs shifts 3 times per day and has to make whatever adjustments become necessary based upon officers taking time off for sick leave or vacations. He stated that this should not be a problem when the Lieutenant is hired.

David P. stated that police overtime is problematic in any budget; special events up 9%; investigation up by 6% - you have to cover events on short notice.

Tom is interested in having fewer seasonal employees and more of the officers live in our community; keeping the money earned here in the winter.

The Chief gave a brief overall view to the Board of what the seasonal officers do stating that it is an incredibly difficult job to do, and this is how a number of full-time officers started out. He highly recommends keeping these seasonal officers.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager's recommended budget for Dept. 210, in the amount of \$2,563,936 .**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Robert Anthony**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**299 Parking – Chief of Police, Parking Administrator (\$492,549):**

Parking Administrator Domenic Rosati and Chief Golden appeared before the Board. Chief Golden stated that the overall 299 budget is level funded with the exception of an increase in salaries which is contractual; a \$9,000 increase for the Business Parking Manager position as discussed at last night's budget meeting; an \$8,000 increase for software licenses for the parking kiosks, and a \$10,000 increase for bank charges due to those people who use credit cards. The MPL and Grace Hall have now opened up for credit card use.

Tom stated that we have more resident parking stickers out than we have residents. He would like to have a conversation on the number of resident parking stickers.

Cheryl would like to see parking spots back on the corner of Winthrop & Bradford on both sides. There was a brief discussion held on making sure that parking enforcement is carried out for anyone parking in a no parking area; no preferential treatment for anyone. There is a difference between unloading and parking. We are business friendly, but need to have legal enforcement. Domenic stated that through education and training this can and will be done.

**MOTION: Move that the Board of Selectmen adopt the Town Manager's recommended budget for Dept. 299, in the amount of \$492,549.**

**Motion: Raphael Richter**

**Seconded: Erik Yingling**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

**Police and Parking Capital Improvement Program**

Dan stated that the only changes are the moving of the server's (MIS budget) and asking to repurpose funds in the Water Enterprise Fund; nothing in the police budget CIP has changed.

**3. Other – None.**

**Motion to adjourn at 9:27pm by Erik Yingling**

**Seconded: Raphael Richer**

**5/0/0 Motion passed.**

Minutes transcribed by: Loretta Dougherty