



**Town of Provincetown
The Visitor Services Board
March 18, 2019, 3:00 p.m.
Town Hall, Judge Welsh Room
260 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA**

Start Time: 3:00 p.m.

Attending – Rick Murray, Chair; Lesley Marchessault, Vice Chair; Susan Avellar, At Large; Andrea Sawyer, At Large; Regina Cassidy, At Large; Jay Gurewitsch, At Large;

Staff: Anthony Fuccillo, Director of Tourism; Nina Cantor, Assistant Director of Tourism

Minutes:

Public Hearing – Expenditure of Town Funds Articles recommended by the VSB

Article 40. Expenditures from the Tourism Fund.

To see if the Town will vote to transfer from the Tourism Fund the sum of \$750,000 to be expended under the direction of the Select Board and the Visitor Services Board to fund the following expenditures which market, beautify or enhance tourism in Provincetown pursuant to Chapter 178 of the Acts of 1996:

1. \$140,000 for coordination/support of the Visitor Services Board and the Tourism Department, and costs related thereto;
2. \$350,000 for marketing, and costs related thereto;
3. \$50,000 for municipal projects, and costs related thereto;
4. \$200,000 for tourism grants, and costs related thereto;
5. \$10,000 for Beautification Committee, and costs related thereto; or to take any other action relative thereto.

[Requested by the Select Board and the Visitor Services Board]

Explanation of Article 40: This article transfers \$750,000 from the Tourism Fund to cover the costs associated with the Tourism Office pursuant to the Five-Year Financial Plan for Tourism

Fund Expenditures proposed by the Visitor Services Board and approved by the Select Board each year. Tourism funds are generated by 35% of the room occupancy tax

2. Public Statements (Board Members do not respond)
 - a. NONE
3. Public Hearing Closed

Visitor Services Board Meeting

1. Public Statements

- None

2. Town Meeting Warrant Articles –Discussion dependent. Motions may be made. Votes may be taken

- None

3. Presentations:

A. Red Thread Productions, Nadine Licostie - Recap of New York Times Travel Show

- Found it to be successful and there is a lot of data.
- AF shared that we have both booths for the 2020 expo
- JG asked if NL can give us info about the leads generated from the 1st and 2nd show's attended and if we receive earned media from either show. NL responded that this year we collected 535 trade leads. They are

all part of the communications database and they are used for newsletters and press releases, media releases. They also go onto PR Web. We try to tell a story about what is going on in Provincetown. They are usually event driven in some way, or about art/entertainment. We can pull the numbers of how many people open them. We use the names for remarketing for Facebook and media marketing. It is the best use. Email newsletters are making a comeback. We are still looking into ways of get more names. We want a bigger, more robust list. We've been talking about doing things along-side with the businesses in town. We are now at the stage to help the business community market and should we do advertising/newsletters. The retail emails are valuable but we need to be careful how often we inundate them with information. We haven't done any testing or focus group. We could use them for quantitative studies.

- JG asked again about the free earned media. NL responded that we cannot identify any earned media that came out of the travel show.
- AF stated media kits were sent to all those at attended
- NL stated media relations are a time consuming and expensive thing to do. We are spending our resources on the creative end and not the PR end.
- RM asked if the kiosks at the tourism office can be used. They can list everything and there won't have any issues with which business we choose to promote. We spent a lot of money on them and they are not being utilized at all. We need to do a visual and a way to capture emails.
- SA stated that the Chamber request for emails through membership was not well received. And asked if the kiosks can that be revolving with the time of year? RM stated that they can, but what we have now is outdated. We hired a firm and it's still on hold.
- NL stated that it's on hold for website and there are limited resources for the amount of time. Once the website is running, there will be email collections.
- SA asked if the pictures would be changed periodically and RM stated that the staff and Bellweather should discuss
- AS asked to be placed on the email list for the blasts from Red Thread
- NL stated that they are sent to the Provincetown stakeholders list and will add the VSB
- AS asked if the emails include the emails from the survey. NL responded that it does not since the emails are owned by the businesses.
- RC asked to clarify how we follow-up with the kiosks and they need to be brought to the forefront and to just do it!

RM asked that the presentation be interrupted for a public statement from a visitor had traveled from Mashpee to attend.

Public Statement

Mwalim (Morgan James Peters) General Manager of Song Keepers, Ltd., which is a nonprofit as well as a member of the GroovaLottos, a Grammy nominated soul-funk group.

- Mwalim shared what they are bringing to Provincetown this summer. The Soul Session is a theater piece which will be performed every Saturday from June through September at Focsicle. The show is built around the Grammy nominated group the GroovaLottos and is celebrating the soul musicians. He invited all to come to 10 years of soul in one night with all original scores. We want to help bring this diversity to Provincetown. He is looking for support for getting the word out.

Presentations continued:

B. Red Thread – Survey updates and recommendation for next steps

- NL stated that there is always something to research and something to find. Every time we do the work we are doing, we try to measure them the best we can - who we are reaching and who are like minded.
- It would be great if we had a lot of funds. It is expensive, and we are trying to be careful. MTI suggests looking at what already exists by agencies or nonprofits. There is material already in the public domain if we want to know more of who our visitors are and what would bring them here.

- Any of the work we do is valuable and we should look at how we are marketing the business community. We should be asking the business community – having a dialogue with them if it is working for them. Do we want to be spending on the entire 12 months which is costly and time consuming but it won't bring us any value. Ask the business owners to tell us what is missing... where are you looking for activation? What would help businesses and organizations in town? A better understanding of constituents.
- LM asked NL to explain further to break down about what your ideals would be in terms of working with the business community. Are you going to want representatives? Something you open to everyone? Monthly conversations?
- NL responded that we need to think in our scope and the Tourism department scope. What can we be doing better? Like economic development and finding ways to (even if monthly) get to do this. We have no data from the art community about who comes here. We don't receive the galleries press releases. I asked the National Seashore and now we get their press releases. Entertainment seems a bit easier. There is a lot of exposure. An immediate need would to have a better dialogue with the arts community.
- LM asked where is the impetus would be. Would Red Thread sign up for these releases?
- NL - This is a small scope of work for us - specifically, the tourism department. We need knowledge – when things are open, when things are going on... it's a struggle to get information
- RM asked if the impetus on the staff. Should staff be getting the information? There is a lot of mistrust within the businesses. Some do things on their own well and others do not. There are some nonprofits that have professional staff. And with Bellweather and their stats, we will work with them. It is difficult to get people to share information. I don't have the answers. We have constraints – we have things working against us. Many would share it.
- LM asked if we have a comprehensive list of businesses. NL stated yes.
- LM asked if instead of getting on a weekly update, if we can ask for a press release for the year.
- NL stated that the website is the crux of this whole effort. We have to know how it works and how to activate it. We can talk about a season of music/art/etc. and talk about it in broader terms.
- RG offered to NL to discuss that with the Economic Development Committee. The committee can put together what is needed and it may help pull things together. We can help get information to you. NL stated that would be perfect.
- JG stated that there is a significant amount of data from Bellweather and Spark i.e. what are the best hashtags, etc. which can help with the businesses. And the business community will get a strong RTI (return on investment). But Bellweather cannot reach out to every business and we need to encourage the businesses to update their google business listing. We have a local business person who works for google.
- NL stated that we have done a great amount of outreach with our current website with the budget that we have and we shouldn't have to promote google, Facebook and Instagram. NL feels we can't rely on those outside services. We need to protect ourselves and our businesses.
- JG stated that we are supposed to be representing everyone to the entire world. There is only so much one can be spoon-fed and that some of the businesses have to do work on their own too.
- JG asked if you could illustrate your strategy for the town in 3 sentences. Nadine responded that she had given a presentation last fall regarding strategy and will send it to JG.
- LM asked if a meeting with the business community can be set up. We need to be in touch with people for real information. If we can all be in a room maybe it can help us. Put it on the calendar.
- RM – let's set up a roundtable with everyone in April, May – for a few hours.
- Jay – usually the PBG and Provincetown Chamber has spring business meetings.
- RG mentioned that the Town Economic Development people are coming back and doing workshops and presentations in April. It appears that everyone is trying to come together.
- AF stated that we have had business summits in the past. The web is only good as what information is there. Some are not as savvy and don't do work on their website.
- RM asked NL for a four4 minutes synopsis with Bellweather and Red Thread. NL stated that she had her one on one interview with them and will be meeting in NY and finding a way to gather things together for creative. Part of their remit is their videography and photography and having photographers with main events. We

have done a great job using the materials we have and we need fresh materials. NL feels positive about the relationship and they will work together.

- RM stated that we don't want to share our video/photos that and there are ways to slice it and dice it but there are photos that are mine that are being used and are not getting credited. What is the best way to do that through staff?
- AF – Bellweather needs to work with the Town and to go through the Tourism office.
- RM asked if we can call businesses and ask for artwork
- SA suggested we reach out to our grant recipients

C. Red Thread/The Spark Group Digital Media Recap

Dan Holtzman, Digital Analyst, the Spark Group (Via Phone)

- DH reviewed the handout of the Spark Group presentation
- The March and April overall goal and idea was to target LGBTQ tourism and family friendly tourism and with that information, we can use the greatest hits on Provincetown - drag, dunes, food, etc.
- Great views! There were 21 million impressions and 170,000 to the website. They got excited and it was a solid performance.
- FB was great for traffic and engagements; thousands of reactions; most were likes/loves and comments shared. LGBTQ is the top performer across the board. We primarily focused on NE and some regional targeting from the survey.
- Drag ads did well as well as the ads promoting specific events... the ads were carousels.
- Instagram had solid results but it is less effective for clicks to the website. There were a lot of "likes" on ads. But social engagement is important, it is very important and so are shared comments.
- Facebook is older demographics and Instagram is younger demographics – ages 18-34.
- We had better results for men but still ok with both genders
- Targets are people who visit the website and re-purpose the ads to them. The LGBTQ produced the most ad views and the most people. Display campaigns are google ads on websites and content users around LGBTQ as well as tourism. The main bread and butter are awareness and impressions – over 11 million. Instagram is good for impressions. FB is good for engagement.
- Drag works the best so far for digital placement. But the flag and couples work well too. Google does have people they can't identify.
- Website analytics – The campaign launched in early April with the same in the campaign compare to the prior year, the number increases are huge. Largest contributor is Facebook, google, and Instagram. Very exciting!
- Conclusions and next step - we have done great and a lot of the people reacted positively and a lot of new users. A lot of results for the dollar.
- RM asked what new audiences we should be exploring. DH stated that it would be great to use that audience and then target more areas along the United States with LGBTQ, and perhaps in other cities. For example there is great use in San Francisco, so let's target Chicago.
- RM mentioned Austin Texas Colorado, New Orleans, Palm Springs and to please identify other areas to retarget. What about international?
- DH stated that in terms of other countries, until we master the US, there are limits such as language targeting and different regulations. Let's capitalize on the US more.
- JG asked if he has remarketing data from the tradeshow. DH stated that they didn't use that audience in 2018 but we are using them in 2019.
- JG stated that we got a lot more impressions but are we not spending more on google? They are spending more time on the website because they are doing research.
- DH replied that they are both beneficial but they keep things based on the cost per view. The main crux of social is we are getting more clicks to the website plus feedback and we can't produce that on google displays.
- JG stated that the data you gave us contradicts that. It states that google is cheaper.
- NL stated that is not in the strategy until we get the new website.

- DH stated it is the top five audiences so ages 35-66 performed better than others. Yes, it's broad.
- JG asked which ads were running the last 2 weeks of August. DH answered that event ads and LGBTQ ads – but he will confirm that get back to you.
- JG stated that the VSB had asked if we could see ads that are not working. NL stated that they will get you that information.
- AS asked why there was such a drop in July and August. DH answered it was because we were prepping.
- AS stated that there are a lot of events that get a lot of press and some smaller events do not get promoted. NL responded that we are trying to open it up to the other categories, and we are trying different things. We want your feedback – is it resonating and or not. We can try different ads during different times.
- AS stated that most of the images are the same... art stroll?
- RM stated that there are no pictures of B&B's, inns and hotels. It has to be in the spring campaign.
- NL stated that it was in the fall campaign. RM responded that it needs to be for spring.
- JG stated that the campaign needs to include retail
- NL stated that there are concerns about hotels/retails and will talk about with AF and NC
- AS asked why are we using old bags for the NYTTS? AF stated that they are past bags and we are using up the inventory.
- RC asked if the Facebook top ads were more than one show. NL responded yes.

4. Director's Report

- We are on target with what is committed and available and our projections. Once we finish this spring, we will have \$167 remaining.
- AF reviewed the timeline from Bellweather's timeline. They have completed phase one and are now working on phase 2. They presented their findings to the working committee and will be presenting to the Stakeholder's Group on March 27, 2019. There will be another presentation to the Stakeholder's Group on May 1, 2019.
- RM asked if we are launching September 30, 2019. AF confirmed that it is the plan.

Media Placement & Activity:

Publication/Project	Purpose	Up To/Amount
None		

Tourism Administration:

Organization / Project	Purpose	Up To/Amount
None		

5. **Board Members' Statements—comments from Board members.** Discussion dependent. Motions may be made. Votes may be taken.
- JG has a list for video. Examples are Canadian (Nova Scotia) is rocking it!
 - Can we move away from whale tale – and the food images... make them more live? There are amazing views here and we are not using them. The images we are using can be anywhere.

Upcoming meetings – All meetings are held at the Judge Welsh Room at 3 p.m.

April 8th

April 22nd

May 6th

May 20th

June 3rd

June 17th (Possible conflict)

July 8th

August 5th

September 9th
September 23rd

Motion to Adjourn

Motion: LM

Second: RC

Motion Approved 6-0; Motion Carries

Meeting Adjourned at 4:43 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Nina Cantor
Assistant Director of Tourism