

**Historic District Commission
Meeting of
May 4, 2005, 4:00 PM
Town Hall, Provincetown, MA 02657**

Members Present: John Dowd, Chair; Carol Neal, Vice Chair; Meg Stewart; and Polly Burnell

Excused Absence: Eric Dray

Town Hall Representatives: Maxine Notaro, Permit Coordinator and Doug Taylor, Building Commissioner.

Work Session

Minutes

The Work Session commenced at 3:30 PM. A motion was made to accept the minutes of the meetings of February 2nd, February 16th and March 2nd. The minutes of March 23rd and April 20th will be voted on at the next meeting.

Moved by: Meg Stewart

Seconded by: John Dowd

Yea: 4 Nay: 0

A quorum being present, Chair John Dowd called the Public Hearing to order at 4:01 PM.

Public Hearings

Case #2005-22 *(Continued from March 23rd and will be continued at the May 18th meeting)*

Application by Peter Page on behalf of Jean Marino for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to remove a door and replace with a wood door and sidelight at the property located at **14 Center Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Case #2005-32 *(Continued from April 20th, 2005 and will be continued on May 18th, 2005)*

Application by Frederick and Joy Long for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to install solar panels at the property located at **90 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Case #2005-33 *(Continued from April 20th, 2005)*

Application by Lawrence Yahn for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a second floor deck addition at the property located at **9 Standish Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Sean Pendergast presented the application for Lawrence Yahn. Meg Stewart mentioned that the application and drawings submitted were not clear. She felt that more information was needed. John Dowd explained that a plan with elevation was needed.

A motion was made to continue this case at the next meeting when more information would be supplied.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 0

Case #2005-36 *(Continued from April 20th, 2005 and will be continued on May 18th, 2005)*

Application by Kevin Soyt for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a shed dormer with studio windows on the northwest elevation; addition of skylights to the

northwest and southeast elevations; addition of door and small balcony on the northeast; replace deck rail with shingle wall to match building and remove chimney built in approximately 1999 at the property located at **9 Pleasant Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Case #2005-37 (Continued from April 20th, 2005)

Application by Peter Schweizer for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct addition/renovation of a 1960s condominium townhouse including raising the roofline 3' and filling in decks and install new egress doors and windows at the property located at **184 Bradford Street, Unit B, Provincetown, MA.**

The applicants returned with amended plans. A motion was made to approved the amended plans according to Guideline #15.

Moved by: Carol Neal

Seconded by: Meg Stewart

Yea: 3 **Nay:** 0

Polly Burnell did not vote as she was not present at the initial presentation on April 20th.

A suggestion was made to the applicants that on the South elevation the triangular pediment window be changed to a flat-top window.

Case #2005-38 (Continued from April 20th, 2005)

Application by Roger W. Galligan on behalf of Dr. Artemis S. Pinkerson for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to construct a 9'6" x 15' addition with alterations to include new foundation, reconstruction of a first floor walls, new siding, roofing, windows and doors, replacement of decks and repairs to existing bulkhead at the property located at **49A Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

The applicant re-presented the case and re-explained the items to clarify them for members of the HDC. They are proposing a renovation to the existing structure. The Counsel representing the owner explained reasons for the application. New blueprints were supplied with corrections and changes from those presented on April 20th. The applicant is raising the first floor thereby raising the second floor. He wants to bring the ceiling height on the first floor to code and to conform with FEMA.

The public was asked for comments and there were no responses.

Doug Taylor, Building Commissioner, explained the ceiling height code stating that the ceiling height has to be 7'6". A general discussion ensued regarding ceiling height in relation to the codes. A short discussion regarding external stairs followed.

Meg Stewart emphasized that the HDC can override the code if need be. John Dowd expressed his opinion in keeping to the original form of the building as much as possible.

Counsel stated that some portions of the building are not visible from public ways. Meg Stewart suggested that a site visit be made to check on the visibility of certain elevations.

The architect explained the fenestration and the changes requested. John Dowd explained that with the added height the current windows would be proportionally too small.

It was moved to table the discussion until a site visit can be made. Because of the meeting running late, it was decided, with the consent of the applicants, to make the site visit at 3:30 PM on May 18th.

Case #2005-36 (Continued from April 20th, 2005 and will be continued on May 18th, 2005)

Application by William N. Rogers, P.E., P.L.S. on behalf of Harlan J. and Lois G. Streib for a Certificate of

Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to lift the existing main building and cottage and install new brick faced crawl space foundations. Renovate the existing main building in-place, with no increase in height or size. Renovate the existing cottage, in-place, with an increase of 18" to peak height (existing height is 17' 10" and proposed height will be 10' 4"). Install new structural members and framing along with the replacement and/or relocation of existing windows and doors at the property located at **44-48 Pearl Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Case #2005-40 **Application by Barnett Adler on behalf of Brenda Dean and Jill Smith** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to repair/rebuild the front porch; repair/rebuild the front steps and bring the staircase in line with the bungalow style of house at the property located at **6 Atlantic Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Barnett Adler and Deborah Paine explained that structural problems were found with the porch when the shingles were removed. A general discussion followed regarding the placement of the columns at the top of the stairs. The applicant agreed to move the columns to the width of the staircase.

A motion was made to accept the application with changing the position of the columns to line up with the width of the stairs. This is covered by Guideline #6a.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 **Nay:** 0

Case #2005-41 **Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Thomas Ravenel** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to replace all existing awning and fixed picture windows on ground level with new double hung windows with pine trim at the property located at **8 Cook Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Neal Kimball explained the application and adding an egress door on the 1st floor on the South side of the building.

A motion was made to accept this application as presented with the note to have the handrails be evenly spaced and captured between the top and bottom rails and the chimney to be removed. The Guidelines are #13 for the stairs, #6a for the doors and #8b for the chimney.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Carol Neal

Yea: 4 **Nay:** 0

Case #2005-42 **Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Vernon Brown** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval for the renovation of four free-standing cottages including reframing of roofs to increase pitch, remove covered patio from cottages 3 & 4 and bump out footprints and replace all windows and doors and change placement at the property located at **10 Washington Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

John Dowd asked for comments from the public regarding this application. No members of the public in favor were in attendance. David Chambers of 12 Washington Avenue expressed his concern about the raising the height of the cottages. Aletha Metcalf of 8 Law Street opposed the changes as she felt that the alterations would change the character of the neighborhood. Gary Coll of 165 Bradford Street felt that the changes would completely block the view of sky, light, etc. Paul Newman of 8 Washington Street agreed with the other speaks and spoke against the application.

Doug Taylor, Building Commissioner, stated that he would not require a second means of egress other than the bedroom windows.

Neal Kimball described the changes to cottages 1 and 2. He stated that the footprint will be the same with both cottages. Cottages 3 and 4 are similar and are connected by a covered patio. It was felt that the footprints of cottages 3 and 4 would be increased by taking away the open patio area.

Polly Brunell felt that she had a problem with accepting the application with many buildings on one street being made taller at one time. It would change the streetscape. Meg Stewart agreed.

David Chambers, abutter, would like to see a compromise on the heights of the cottages. There was a general discussion regarding the preservation of the cottage complex and was emphasized by Carol Neal, Meg Stewart and Polly Brunell.

Neal Kimball stated that the cottages have to be gutted due to mold, rot, etc.

Meg Stewart asked what the height would be of cottage 1 if the increase in height of the 1st floor to 7'6" which is code. Mr. Kimball stated that it would be about 11'8" with the same roof pitch.

Carol Neal felt she could reach a compromise in giving more space. John Dowd felt that the ceiling height could come up to 7'6" and reduce the overall height from the plan. He has a problem with the "bumpout" of cottages 3 and 4 and felt that the design should be more in relation with cottages 1 and 2.

Mr. Kimball requested that he return in two weeks with new drawings incorporating the suggested changes.

A motion was made to continue this case at the Mary 18th meeting.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 4 Nay: 0

Case #2005-43 **Application by Glenn Cesan** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to extend an existing second floor roofline to provide for a small painting studio and storage area at the property located at **10 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Glen Cesan explained his application request to extend the existing second floor roofline. His plans showed octagon shaped windows that the HDC members were against. Small square windows were suggested.

Carol Neal read a letter from two condo members requesting more information. The owner of the property mentioned that the condo owners approved the plans and that the two members were not present as they were away at the time of the meeting. There were no comments from the public.

John Dowd suggested that awning windows with factory-applied muntins be used in lieu of the octagon windows.

A motion was made to approve the application with the change that the windows be small standard windows covered by Guideline #s 5c and 15.

Moved by: John Dowd

Seconded by: Polly Burnell

Yea: 3 Nay: 1

Meg Stewart voted against.

A new drawing will be sent to Maxine Notaro showing the window change.

Case #2005-44 **Application by Joe Smith** for a Certificate of Compliance to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to reduce the beach side attic roof to create a deck; raise the attic roof 4'; replace skylights with dormers; enclose the outside stairs in the entry and ell on the west side; replace windows and doors; reside and re-shingle; construct new deck rails and columns; remove the cinder block chimney and add a flue for a wood stove at the property located at **151A Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

John DeSouza explained the changes and stated that at one time the building was a waterfront workshop and is now a 2-family house. He also mentioned that the changes would not be a massive change of increase in scale. The scale will be the smallest compared to the neighboring buildings. He also explained the changes requested to each elevation.

John Dowd asked the public for comments. Richard Schneider of 153 Commercial Street stated that the building was a 19th century "fish shack." He felt that the basic architectural integrity has remained. Mary Beth Crachetta of Conan Street spoke on behalf of neighbors on Conan Street and mentioned the historical aspects of the building and the historical integrity of the seascape. Donald Vaughan, a condominium owner at 153 Commercial Street, spoke against the application and destroying an historical building. He asked that the HDC make a site visit to see it more accurately than the pictures provided. He submitted a letter he had to be placed in the file.

John DeSouza replied to the comments made by Mr. Vaughan and said that the building was not a "fish shack" but originally a woodworking shop. He also responded to other points Mr. Vaughan made.

Carol Neal proposed a site visit. Those in attendance at the site visit were HDC members John Dowd, Polly Burnell, Meg Stewart and Carol Neal. Two abutters and the applicants were also in attendance.

Polly Burnell stated that the building was "pure." It was also stated that in the presentation the building remains in balance and scale.

A motion was made to accept the application as proposed with the exception that the dormers on the East elevation will be removed from the plans, in exchange for allowance of dormers on west elevation. The dormers on the West elevation will be re-presented as shed-type set back from the North/South elevations. A new drawing for the West elevation will be submitted.

Moved by: John Dowd **Seconded by:** Polly Burnell **Yea: 3 Nay: 1**
Meg Stewart voted against

A motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 8:30 PM.

Moved by: Carol Neal **Seconded by:** Polly Burnell **Yea: 4 Nay: 0**

Respectfully submitted by
Joel Glasser
Recording Secretary

Approved by: _____ on _____
John Dowd, Chairman Date