

**Provincetown Historic District Commission
September 14, 2005 Town Hall**

Meeting Minutes

Members Present: Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, John Dowd, Marcene Marcoux, Clo Tepper, Eric Dray (arrived at 3:45 p.m.)

Members Absent: Carol Neal (excused absence)

Staff: Maxine Notaro and Doug Taylor

Work Session – 3:30 p.m.

3 Fishburn Court

Tom Thompson presented his request to change the siding material from cedar shingles, as originally proposed, to 10” clapboard.

The Commission agreed.

459 Commercial Street

Preliminary plans were presented to the Commission. Tom Thompson is willing to have an on-site visit. He was told that **no decision could be forthcoming until a definite plan is presented.**

Policy discussion:

Polly proposed having a working meeting and Eric agreed so that the Commissioners could finalize policies. Also it was thought that they could begin generating a list of appropriate products, which wouldn't preclude applicants from bringing in other possible products. Maxine said this is a critical need. John Dowd also said general rules about “whether it's a Cape?” and what's appropriate, etc. Eric said that windows are the most important of features. The guidelines for historic districts say that if the original house had historic significance then what these districts want to preserve is this style and materials. The Commission is still trying to refine their.

10 Pearl Street

The board members briefly discussed the oval door pattern. It is incorrect. The Building Commissioner will do an on-site inspection and call the property owners to correct the possible violation.

Public Hearing 4pm

The hearing was called to order at 4:00 p.m.

2005-62 (Continued from August 03, 2005)

Application by Rick Murray on behalf of Bradford Montello Realty Trust for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to extend the roofline and dormer on the rear (South) elevation and change a window/door configuration at the property located at **35 Bradford Street and, to relocate an existing 3-bedroom unit to a new single family dwelling on the Southwest corner of the lot (formerly 9 Montello Street), Provincetown,**

MA.

Members sitting on the case are: Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, John Dowd, Clo Tepper, Eric Dray.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Discussion:

The following motion was made and recorded by Eric Dray. He then gave the disc to Maxine and she will forward the entire motion with its 12 or 13 conditions to me for inclusion in these minutes: (see attached decision)

Motion by: Eric Dray Second by: Polly Burnell

To approve the application, pursuant to Guidelines 5c & 6b re. door and window replacements. The dormer is approved on the basis that the building has already been largely altered and there is no historic roofline to preserve.

Yea: 4

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

2005-66

Application by Robert Valois on behalf of Stephen Syta for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to alter an existing roofline of the garage/studio at the property located at **5 Pleasant Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: John Dowd, Polly Burnell, Eric Dray, Nathan Butera, and Marcene Marcoux.

Discussion:

Robert Valois presented the case to the Commissioners. The center ridge will be going up 5 ft. They went to zoning and a couple of letters came in from neighbors. The increase is just to gain storage, with half of it is a garage and the other half will be a studio. John says the proposed windows look as though they have dropped down. The reason given by Robert Valois is that - it's because there is a retaining wall he proposed building on top of the wall. He said that he is not changing the floor heights. Polly's research wasn't valid because she looked at the wrong map.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion: Nathan Butera Second: Marcene Marcoux

Pursuant to guideline 5, to grant a Certificate of compliance, with the following condition:

Attempt to retain the existing 6 over 6 windows. If replacements are needed they should be Brosco and match the 6 over 6 configuration.

Yea: John Dowd, Polly Burnell, Eric Dray, Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux.

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

2005-69

Application by Deborah Paine, Inc. on behalf of Anne Maguire for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-

Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to shingle gable end of cottage and install two skylights at the property located at **7 Cook Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Member sitting on the case are: John Dowd, Eric Dray, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, Clo Tepper.

Discussion:

Deborah Paine explained that there are 2 cottages in the back of the Inn at Cook Street. The south gabled end was never shingled. She wants to shingle it and add a couple of skylights for ventilation and light. She also said she would make it only one room as advised.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion: Nathan Butera Second: Polly Burnell

To grant a certificate of compliance for the plans as presented and, shingle the side wall (south)

Yea: John Dowd, Eric Dray, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, Clo Tepper.

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

2005-67

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Vernon Brown for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add shed dormers and enclose an egress stairway on the back of the structure; add doghouse dormers on the front; replace all windows with insulated double hung; add and reconfigure layout of existing windows; add two egress doors, all exterior doors to be replaced with historically correct doors, remove vinyl siding and replace with cedar clapboards, finish roof with architectural grade shingles at the property located at **10 Washington Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: John Dowd, Eric Dray, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux.

Discussion:

A lengthy discussion was held. The plan, as presented by Neal Kimball, seemed vague to the Commissioners. The commission members raised concerns about obscuring the gable end.

Public Comment: Two women abutters sitting in the audience want to see the plan and were infuriated about the demolition of the four cottages on that property.

Motion: Polly Burnell Second: John Dowd

Continue the case until the following week (September 21st).

Yea: John Dowd, Eric Dray, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux.

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

Eric Dray, concerning this property, asked an administrative question on the demolition of the four cottages. The plan had been approved for the renovation of the four cottages and now they have been demolished which the Commission had not approved. Doug Taylor, the Building Commission, “thought or assumed” that they would be torn down. The judgment was that they were not historic.

Eric said that in writing decisions we need to be specific on what is approved for demolition and what is not. Further, should it be deemed necessary to demolish a building, then the entire case would have to return to the Historic District Commission before a demolition is allowed.

Neal Kimball responded, saying that it was not his intention to demolish these cottages. It was not a preference. We were going to raise them – that was our intention. The Building Commissioner made the decision that the foundations were inadequate.

2005-68

Application by John DeSouza on behalf of Ron Reil for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to renovate two attached cottages to include new foundations, roofline, windows and doors, and the addition of two dormers to the east side at the property located at **9 Dyer Street, Rear, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Eric Dray, Nathan Butera, John Dowd.

Discussion:

John DeSouza presented the case for Ron Reil. We don't have a property survey because the survey stopped at 5 Dyer St! John DeSousa asked about a demolition or partial demolition delay. The reason given for this renovation is because the cottages are "cramped and unappealing." John DeSousa said they just want to add air on that side.

Public comment: Two letters from unhappy abutters, Anthony Sorensen and Susan, were read into the record. The two abutters both live in condos on 14 Youngs Court. They claim these increased rooflines with rob them of light and air in their condos and block all the natural light.

The chair of the Commission said there is no protection for light or air or view.

Eric Dray said what you're proposing, is definitely a partial demolition. So we're going to have to think about it. John Dowd suggested that perhaps the grade could be elevated if the complaint is that the cottages are sitting too low off Bradford Street.

Motion: Polly Burnell Second: Eric Dray

To continue the case until a future meeting.

Yea: 5

Nay: 0 Abstain 0

Proposed Historic District Commission Fee Increases

The Historic District Commission will hold a public hearing on Wednesday, September 14, 2005 to consider the following fee increases:

Fees	Current	Proposed
Historic District Commission Administrative Review	\$25.00	\$50.00

Amendments	\$50.00	\$100.00
Additions/Alterations	\$75.00	\$100.00
New Construction	\$150.00	\$200.00
Demolition	\$150.00	\$250.00

The public is encouraged to submit any written comments to the Office of the Building Commissioner, Town Hall, 260 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA 02657, or in person at the hearing.

Doug Taylor explained that his budget covers about ¼ of his department's expenses. Doug did an analysis and he calculated all the meetings they attend. The intent is to make it run like a business.

The public hearing was held and there was no one who spoke in opposition to these fees.

Motion: Eric Dray Second: John Dowd

The Commissioners agreed to the increases.

Yea: 5

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

Other business:

Maxine Notaro informed the group that minutes of their meetings should be approved at every meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 7:50 p.m.

Recorded by
Evelyn Rogers Gaudiano

Revised and respectfully submitted by
Carla Anderson
Recording Secretary

Approved by _____ at the 12/21/05 meeting
John Dowd, Chairperson