

The Provincetown Historic District Commission
Wednesday, October 19, 2005 Town Hall

Meeting Minutes

Members Present: Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd - Chairperson

Excused Absence: Eric Dray

Town Hall Representative(s): Doug Taylor & Maxine Notaro

Work Session 3:30

The work session was called to order by John Dowd at 3:35 pm

Administrative reviews:

491 Commercial,

Mark Kinnane, Cape Associates, wants to use hardy board, a concrete based product, instead of red cedar clapboard. He presented a comparison board of the materials with finish paint.

Commission members voiced concerns about using traditional products, i.e. authenticity and integrity of historic buildings –vs- the low maintenance concrete. The prominence of the building, its use, and location are factors in the decision, along with not knowing how these “modern materials” will age over time.

The commission was in favor of using shingles on the dormers.

Mark Kinnane agreed to get a list of other buildings in town that have the product installed.

The applicant will return on November 2, 2005.

12 Atlantic Avenue,

Tom Edwards, Residential Development, wants to do spindle railings instead of flat railings on the Atlantic Street side of building in order to match the Bradford Street side of the building.

The board agreed to allow the spindles, though most members favor the square post look.

Public Hearings 4pm

The public hearing was called to order by John Dowd at 4:05 p.m.

-
2005-67 (Continued from October, 2005)

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Vernon Brown for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add shed dormers and enclose an egress stairway on the back of the structure; add doghouse dormers on the front; replace all windows with insulated double hung; add and reconfigure layout of existing windows; add two egress doors, all exterior doors to be replaced with historically correct doors, remove vinyl siding and replace with cedar clapboards, finish roof with architectural grade shingles at the property located at **10 Washington Avenue, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux, John Dowd, Polly Burnell

Discussion:

Neal Kimball presented the plans. The proposed changes on north elevation will bring the windows in the dormers more in line with the windows in the main body of the structure. Enclosing the rear stairway on the west elevation was discussed as improving the existing decking and stairway.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion: By: John Dowd Second: Marcene Marcoux

Pursuant to guidelines 5.a, 5.c, 6.a, 6.b, 7, 8.a.i., 8.a.ii, 8.b, 15;

To grant a certificate of compliance for the plans as presented, with a doghouse dormer on the east elevation, and a shed dormer on the west elevation.

All approved replacement windows must use non-tinted, clear glass and ½ screens, unless otherwise provided in the decision. Full screens or windows with Low-E or other tinted glass are not permitted.

Yea: Nathan Butera, Marcene Marcoux, John Dowd, Polly Burnell

Nay: 0 Abstain: Carol Neal

2005-72

Application by Fred Ambrose on behalf of China Trust, T. Gandolfo, Trustee for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to demolition Building A & B and reconstruct the basic same massing as the existing structures at the property located at **361 A & B Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Discussion:

Applicant requested this be continue until 11/2/05

Motion By: John Dowd Second: Nathan Butera

Accept request for continuance.

Yea: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

2005-73

Application by Sacha Richter for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to add two awning windows above the studio doors on the first floor of the North side of the building at the property located at **457-459 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, John Dowd, Polly Burnell and Nathan Butera.

Discussion:

The applicant wishes to install additional windows for light and ventilation on north side (Commercial St.), over the doors, trimmed in red cedar to match the building.

John Dowd questioned the possibility of putting the windows in the door. The applicant wishes to keep the doors unobstructed for additional wall space within the studio.

John Dowd noted that this is new construction and many concessions have been allowed for this property because this is contains an artist studio.

Doug Taylor commented that this request responds to the specific and cultural use of the property.

John Dowd suggested a single transom window the full width of the doors.

Carol Neal read bylaw 8.2 to regarding the interior use of the building, and bylaw 15 referring to the Town’s “unique heritage”.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion By: John Dowd Second: Clo Tepper

Pursuant to guidelines 5.c;

To grant a certificate of compliance for the following;

1] Install a pair of awning windows, with 3 light panes each, to be trimmed out as a single window. (above the doors on the north elevation).

2] Use wider trim around the doors.

3] All approved replacement windows must use non-tinted, clear glass, unless otherwise provided in the decision. Windows with Low-E or other tinted glass will not be permitted.

Yea: Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, John Dowd, Polly Burnell, Nathan Butera.

Nay: 0 Abstain: 0

Maxine will need a new plan for the trim and window changes.

2005-74

Application by Tom Thompson for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to extend cottage, add ell and small dormers to the cottage, install new windows and doors; no increase in height at the property located at **3 Fishburn Court, Provincetown, MA.**

Marcene Marcoux recused herself and exited the room (due to potential conflict of interest with Tom Thompson, since this is his personal property.)

Members sitting on the case are: Carol Neal, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Discussion:

Tom Thompson and John DeSouza presented the plans. The applicant seeks to incorporate/connect the cottage to the house by constructing an ell. The ell construction would not be visible as the view would be of the existing cottage. They would maintain the existing architectural features.

The board discussed the amount of the building which could be seen from Pearl St.

Public comment: In favor = 1, Opposed = 0.

Donna Flax, 5 Fishburn Ct, thinks the plan will help the property feel less congested.

Letter(s) in file: John Dowd read the letter in the file.

Motion By: Nathan Butera **Second:** Polly Burnell

Pursuant to guidelines 8.a.i;

To grant a certificate of compliance for the plans as presented.

Yea: Carol Neal, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd.

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** Marcene Marcoux, by recusal

2005-75

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Thomas Roberts for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to Reconstruct egress landing on the west side with larger and change railing style to captured baluster, change windows in all existing shed dormers to awning style, add external masonry chimney for added fireplace on the south side, replace all first floor awning windows with double hung, re-shingle side walls as required on the east, west and south sides, replace other windows in kind as required, re-shingle roof with cedar shakes. No changes to structure being requested at the property located at **59 Commercial Street, Main house, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd.

Discussion:

Board had several brief questions regarding the replacement of clapboard, which is supposedly in good shape. Neal explained it would only be replaced as needed.

Each elevation was reviewed. The discussion centered around:

Replacement of 6 over 6 windows in the dormers with 3 awning, 4-pane windows on the west elevation. Screening under the deck area will be contractor grade lattice and nylon mesh screen behind in order to keep animals from nesting under the porch.

The change of windows on east side of building with only 4' to neighboring home.

Proposed plan is to reduce window size to provide bathroom ventilation and create egress. John Dowd suggested using a skylight for ventilation and closing in the bathroom window.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion By: John Dowd **Second:** Carol Neal

Pursuant to guidelines 5.a, 9.a, 9.c, 9.d

To grant a certificate of compliance for the plans as presented with the following revisions;

- 1] Boarding up of east elevation gable end window closest to the south side, on the second story.
- 2] Retaining the original trim.
- 3] East elevation southern most dormer window will not be eliminated.
- 4] Addition of skylight over the bathroom on the south elevation, east side.
- 5] All approved replacement windows must use non-tinted, clear glass and ½ screens, unless otherwise provided in the decision. Full screens or windows with Low-E or other tinted glass are not permitted.

Yea: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd.

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2005-76

Application by Neal Kimball on behalf of Tom Roberts for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to extend existing shed dormer on the west side; remove two smaller bump-outs on the east side and replace with one larger cross-gable style bump-out; remove large first and second floor decks on south side and replace with smaller deck on the first floor and balcony on the second floor; remove exterior stairway and second floor egress door on the north side; replace all existing windows and exterior doors, revise configurations; re-shingle roof and sidewalls with cedar shakes; elevate cottage on pilings by approximately 18" (or as per flood-plane requirements) at the property located at **59 Commercial Street, Oceanside cottage, Provincetown, MA.**

Members sitting on the case are: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Discussion:

The applicant wants to keep the egress from the west side in tact even if garage is removed in the future. Each elevation was reviewed.

North – Applicant submitted a revision to dormer area with knee support. The revision was agreeable to board with a possible door change. The bank of three windows was questioned. There was a suggestion to put one, 2 over 2 window.

South - Chapter 91 comes into consideration as part of plans. The project engineer recommends the building be 12-24" higher. It will be placed on pilings.

John Dowd commented that the plan changes the property from simple cottage with simple add-on dormer to a Victoria looking guest cottage. It does not speak to town maritime heritage. He wants to see it kept simple and authentic.

There was a lengthy discussion regarding the sizes and locations of windows and doors, as well as the size of the balcony.

The board discussed asymmetrical – vs – symmetrical design for windows and doors. Suggestions to the applicant included - possible door and 1 window on upper level, possible offset door. Waterfront elevation guidelines encourage applicant to retain and reflect the historic character of the building.

West – The cantilevered knee to support balcony is not historically accurate. The board suggested using a straight post instead.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Motion By: Nathan Butera **Second:** Polly Burnell

To be continued until 11/2 meeting for revised plans.

Yea: Carol Neal, Marcene Marcoux, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Nay: 0 **Abstain:** 0

2005-77

Application by John DeSouza on behalf of Marcene Marcoux for a Certificate to be issued in accordance with the Provincetown Historic District Commission established under the General By-Laws, Chapter 15 of

the Town of Provincetown. The applicant seeks approval to renovate a circa 1930 astylistic dwelling including lifting the structure to excavate for new pilings and foundation as required to stabilize the structure on the steep slope. Additionally reinforcing the structural framing, removing a bay window, restoring a former balcony, building a new ell in the rear, eliminating a roof deck and reconfiguring a deck and new fenestration at the property located at **186 Bradford Street, Provincetown, MA.**

Marcene Marcoux recused herself and sat with the presenters.

Members sitting on the case are: Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd.

Discussion:

The property owners and John DeSousa presented plans and explained the property needs foundation work and applicant seeks to bring back more of its original character. The house is shifting downhill. Planting of over 100 trees has helped to stabilize the soil, but not enough to keep things from shifting on the severe slopes. In two years the pilings have shifted 8" of slippage.

In 1986 & 1987 major changes were made to the house. This added such things as bay windows, a slider, and other significant alterations not in keeping with its original character.

During the 12 years the owners have occupied the house, many people have explained how the house once looked and functioned, i.e. window and door replacements, roof replacement. Chimney is original, though cracked due to the shifting of the building.

The building will remain at the same height. The foundation will extend further downward.

Owners will maintain vegetation by staging a crane on the west side of the property and work from the North (uphill) side to the South (downhill) side.

Windows will have green trim.

The new addition is to allow for home office space for two separate corporate offices.

Each elevation was reviewed.

North - House is not visible, even by neighbors.

South - Will be shingled to cover the large foundation area.

The location of the new ell and window placement/ sizes will be in keeping with a shingle style construction.

West - Suggestion by John Dowd to create a large fireplace and chimney to anchor the building and create a vertical structure at the juncture of the new ell.

The commission agreed this project included enormous changes from the existing home, but with no written reference to what was originally there, the changes seem to be more in keeping with the style and age of the home.

Public comment: None in favor or against.

Letter(s) in file: John Dowd read four letters in favor of the applicant.

Motion By: John Dowd **Second:** Polly Burnell

Pursuant to guidelines 5.a, 5.c, 6.b, 9, 15;

To grant a certificate of compliance for the plans as submitted with the following revisions;

1] addition of round/river stone fireplace on west wall

All approved replacement windows must be non-tinted, clear glass with ½ screens, unless otherwise provided in the decision. Full screens or windows with Low-E or other tinted glass are not permitted.

Yea: Clo Tepper, Carol Neal, Nathan Butera, Polly Burnell, John Dowd

Nay: Abstain: Marcene Marcoux by recusal

Motion to adjourn: Carol Neal Second: John Dowd

Yea: All Nay: 0

The meeting was adjourned at 7:12 pm.

Respectfully submitted by

Carla Anderson

Recording Secretary

Approved By: _____ at the 12/21/05 meeting.

John Dowd, Chairman