



Historic District Commission

Minutes

The Provincetown Historic District Commission Public Meeting of Wednesday, June 1, 2022 at 3:30 PM in the Judge Welsh Room at Town Hall, 260 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA 02657.

Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2021, this meeting/hearing will be conducted **in person** and as a courtesy via remote means in accordance with applicable law. Please note that while an option for remote attendance and/or participation is being provided as a courtesy to the public, the meeting/hearing will not be suspended or terminated if technological problems interrupt the virtual broadcast, unless otherwise required by law.

Joining the Meeting: [Click here to join the meeting](#)

Microsoft Teams: Join on your computer or mobile app

Phone: Or call in (audio only) [\(833\) 579-7589](tel:8335797589) Phone Conference ID: 133 682 032#

To participate during public comment:

- Teams: Raise hand to be called on to speak; or
- Phone: Speak name clearly to be called on to speak.

Please do not speak again until acknowledged by Chair or meeting moderator.

- Keep your phone muted at all times when not talking (*6 to mute & unmute your phone);
- Do not use speakerphone, Bluetooth devices (speakers or headphones); and
- Mute all background noises, including PTV, television or computer and use only phone audio.

Members present: John Dowd (JD), Acting Chair, PGB Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Clerk, Chamber of Commerce Rep.; Michela Murphy (MM), Alternate; Anthony Iannucci (AI), Alternate.

Members by remote: Chris Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.

Excused Absence: Laurie Delmolino, Chair, Historical Commission Rep.

Staff present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner; Thaddeus Soulé (TS), Town Planner.

JD called the meeting to order at 3:30pm; gave roll-call. TS read hybrid meeting protocols.

Agenda item may be taken out of order and votes may be taken on any of the agenda items below.

1. **Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the June 15, 2022 Public Hearing agenda and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.**

VOTES MAY BE TAKEN:

- i) [5 Lovett's Ct., U5](#) – To replace a fiberglass door with a wood door.

Mark Kinnane presented; said the ugly fiberglass unit is to be replaced with a traditional wood door with two sidelights.

JD spoke in favor of the replacement as presented.

JD made a motion to approve the black door sample with five sidelights on each side. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

Mr. Kinnane requested to continue [4 Miller Hill Rd.](#) to the meeting of June 15.

- ii) [284A Commercial St.](#) – To replace a fence in kind.

Kaolin Davis presented; said she and her parents have owned the property for 50 years and that with a new abutting owner it is time to replace the fence; option of plank fence, intact section of stockade to remain, to aid in reduced flooding; said abutter Steve Schnitzer is happy with her choice of fence; designated 10' set-back per code.

Mr. Schnitzer, owner of [119 Bradford St.](#), submitted a letter in support.

AI recommended a lower fence starting from the street that would curve up to over the car space in the driveway. Ms. Davis remarked that the owners on the other side of the driveway have not proposed a fence for that side.

JD made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the 4' height on the east side at the sidewalk tapers up to 6' at the end. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

JD made a motion to consider the following for Full Review:

- iii) [49 Commercial St.](#) – To replace rotted siding and trim board, existing gutters with copper gutters, windows, a back deck with ipe decking and mahogany railings, front fence with new Bostonian 4' picket fence, wooden shutters with new wooden shutters, front and side stairs with brick and blue stone stairs and an existing cedar roof, to extend a side dormer and add a dormer, and to add brick veneer on all new foundation work;
- iv) [54 Commercial St, U2.](#) – To replace a window with a door;
- v) [119 Commercial St.](#) - To raise a structure approximately 1.5' and brick-face the foundation with flood vents, replace windows, to recreate a cross-gable extension, to add a two-story extension, and add minimal steel and cable rail system, and to replace a roof deck with a new version;
- vi) [69 Pleasant St.](#) – To replace siding, windows, and roof and to add 2 front dormers; and

- vii) [397 Commercial St.](#) - To add a second story to an existing single-story commercial structure and adding a residential unit above.

MM seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; MM, HS, AI, JD.

2. **Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:**

None fielded.

3. **Public Comments:** On any matter not on the agenda below.

None fielded.

4. **Full Hearings:**

- a. [HDC 21-242](#) (*continued to the meeting of July 20th*)
Application by **Brian Alexander**, on behalf of **James A. Green et al.**, requesting to install new windows on the northeast corner sleeping porch on the structure located at **592 Commercial Street**. *Per time waiver.*
- b. [HDC 22-11](#) (*request to continue to the meeting of September 7th*)
Application by **Brian Calhoun**, on behalf of **Rainbow Connection Realty, LLC**, requesting to replace balconies on the south facade and to reconstruct the west facade decks, balconies, and stairwell to include a lift so that the first floor becomes more accessible on the structure located at **174 Commercial Street**.
AH to send time-waiver to be signed.
JD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of September 7, 2022. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; MM, HS, AI, JD.
- c. [HDC 22-53](#) (*continued from the meeting of May 18th*)
Application by **James Rifino** and **Harry Pihl** requesting to install a fence along Cottage Street and Bradford Street on the property located at **8 Bradford Street**.
No one presented.
AH said there was no time to reach out; time waiver as requested.
JD made a motion to continue the decision to the next meeting. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.
- d. [HDC 22-74](#)
Application by **Robin Callaghan**, on behalf of **Jeffrey R. Lick et vir.**, requesting to build an enclosure over an elevator door and replace the trim around it, to remove shingles around the mechanical doors and replace them with trim board, to replace existing mechanical doors in kind, and to enclose a propane tank and electrical and garbage receptacles on the property located at **607 Commercial Street, U3**.
Bill Woodward, Project Manager at Cape Associates, presented by remote; identified two hinged doors to the utilities, said only the appearance would be changed; same style, cleaner look with masking for refuge area.
JD suggested a remedy to unify the left and right and make it one in design aspect. AI asked if it might be possible to re-locate the utility doors to make for a more pronounced

entryway. Mr. Woodward said he could agree but for all that is jammed into the mechanical closet. JD suggested the current door configuration as more attractive than a colonial revival look, removing shingles. MM concurred with JD and added she would be okay with covering the trash bins. AH cautioned against curtailing any access to propane tanks.

JD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of June 15, 2022 from a new submitted sketch. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, LD.

e. [HDC 22-81](#) (continued from the meeting of May 18th)

Application by **Mark Kinnane**, on behalf of **Dean Landy et al.**, requesting to construct a two-story addition on the structure located at **4 Miller Hill Road, U8**.

Per Mark Kinnane, a request to continue.

JD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of June 15, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

f. [HDC 22-85](#)

Application by **Christopher Mathieson** requesting to repair a ballast stone wall, replace concrete front steps, and add a matching picket fence to the left side of the structure on the property located at **1 Winthrop Street**.

Chris Mathieson presented by remote through elevations; requested input from the Board per stone choice and orientation of the stone wall as relates to the front façade and fence option; seeking to replace three steps to e Code compliant; displayed stone photos and a safeguard featured post to prevent future damage from passing autos; will not be doing the stonework himself.

No public comments or letters.

JD made a motion to accept as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

g. [HDC 22-86](#)

Application by **Alex Taratuta**, on behalf of **11 Atlantic Ave Condominium**, requesting to replace an existing pool enclosure with a 6' high fence that will be a boxed baluster style and 18" higher than the current section of fencing parallel to the street on the property located at **11 Atlantic Avenue**.

Alex Taratuta presented; referenced new photos and a PDF of other area elevations; said they are seeking a boxed baluster fence style.

No public comments or letters.

HS noted the owners had done exactly what is prescribed for a semi-private pool.

JD made a motion to accept as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

h. [HDC 22-90](#) (continued from the meeting of May 18th)

Application by **Trevor Pontbriand**, on behalf of **Allan J. Robinson et al.**, requesting to construct a 30 sq. ft. addition, three dormers, and a small overhang above the front door, add a skylight, and replace existing windows, siding, trim and roofing on the structure located at **153 Bradford Street**.

Trevor Pontbriand and Allan Robinson presented. Mr. Pontbriand said they adopted HDC recommendations including windows and dormers made square, double hungs made 2/2, eliminated the crown molding on the Bradford St. windows, rendered a flat roof with just a pitch to drain over the dining room; requested as proposed: clapboards on the Bradford and Arch St sides of main part of the house and kitchen windows. Mr. Robinson noted window units to be 2/1s and minimal visibility.

JD said all the changes look good but questioned if a different window configuration could be achieved to add to the otherwise cohesive design flow and avoid a 1950s-like appearance. Mr. Robinson spoke against double-hungs verses a crank unit, in terms of practicality and greater availability of air flow.

MM spoke of a recent case where clapboards were desired when, historically speaking, shingles would have been appropriate and stressed the need for consistency across decisions. HS agreed. Mr. Robinson said the aim is to clapboard the two main facades for a more attractive look. MM suggested past photos that make the point for clapboards can be added to the application for consideration. JD asserted that the HDC is charged with being more of a preservation board than an alteration board and this small, humble home is unlikely to have been fitted in claps.

JD made a motion to accept the new changes with the caveat that the main building remain shingled. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

AH quoted white cedar shingles at \$350 a square, when they can be had; C's would be \$84 or so a bundle, but the Building Code would be at odds with C's.

i. [HDC 22-100](#) (continued from the meeting of May 18th)

Application by **Ted Smith**, on behalf of **Bowman Morrison Family Holding Trust**, requesting to lift and renovate a structure, including adding dormers and expanding an existing dormer on the south elevation, adding a one-story addition on the west elevation, adding a new entry star on the northwest corner, and reconfiguring an existing egress stair and deck on the northeast corner on the property located at **5 Tremont Street**.

JD recused himself. MM assumed the Chair. CM to fill out a Mullin Report to vote on today's decision as he said he had watched the video of the previous presentation.

Ted Smith presented; went through changes of revised plans A & B as relates to the reorientation of the rear door and staircase away from the edge of the building per east elevation; related that the structure would need to be raised; directed to Plan A in terms of placing the stairs inside, but said he is not in favor of this option.

John Dowd of 112 Commercial St. presented a successful similar re-vamp of the dormers at 6 Pleasant St. Mr. Smith spoke of his preference for Plan B as it works with the set-back; said he is down from the peak by about a foot.

MM said she was having difficulty negotiating through the different plans in tandem with the staircase layout options and the west elevation, would request to see a 3-D rendering for clarity; suggested there was some discrepancy between what Commissioner Delmolino had discussed as appropriate changes to the original plans and what was now being offered. AI questioned the dormer pitch in relation to the roof line.

CM noted a previous case where a raised building plan was requested to be placed in context with the surrounding buildings and suggested this case could benefit as well from that presentation; recommended a site visit, to which MM concurred.

MM made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of June 15, 2022 following a site visit at 2:30pm. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, CM, AI, MM.

JD announced a short recess.

j. [HDC 22-103](#)

Application by **Ted Smith**, on behalf of **Trevor's Trails II, LLC**, requesting to demolish and rebuild an existing two-family residential structure on the property located at **7 Snow Street**.

Ted Smith and Tom Tannariello, owner, presented; Gary Locke, of Billy Rogers, presented by remote, spoke through the engineer's report of extensive structural damage including major water intrusion over an extended period of time, gas holes in the exterior envelope, fallen roof deck, embedded overgrowth and a door which cannot be closed.

Mr. Smith added said there would be issues with fire-line separation per Code in terms of the perimeters and a minimum of 3 ½' separation of abutting property lines; proposed new house to re-locate the chimney and install fewer windows, with a slightly higher roofline.

Darla White, abutter across Bradford St., expressed concern that the expansion of the lot as proposed would negatively impact the small-scale neighborhood and lamented that the project facilitators have not reached out to the surrounding residents; requested the HDC conduct a site visit. Paul Caccamo, abutter and owner of a 1795 Cape for the past 20 years, spoke of the history and longevity of the neighboring structures; gave background of the house dating to 1870; noted that a new sewer system plan was abandoned some years back based on an unsupportable foundation which might affect other structures. Steven Franklin, abutter at 277 Bradford St. also spoke against the project, septic as the big issue.

Mr. Tannariello addressed the septic issue in stating that prior to purchasing the property he contacted the Board of Health and was assured with verification from an ACO that the property has been cleared for development to that end with a standing condition that the sewer is pumped twice a year; said the current situation is not septic, but cesspool.

JD acknowledged the evidential need for a demolition but expressed the wish to move forward with a plan to preserve the historical integrity of the structure which a move could facilitate; said current proposals do not satisfy for an antique Cape, pushed for a federal style with traditional dormers and a back-L. MM asked AH if a variance could be obtained for the window release. AH said this is not something the Zoning Board or Building Department could be in a position to grant with a tear-down situation in play.

Mr. Smith said it is basically moving two walls 4" in. MM asked Mr. Locke if the current tear-down would affect the surrounding structures to which Mr. Locke replied that while they are not at that stage yet, there are protocols to address those concerns regarding putting in a basement. Mr. Smith added that Billy Rogers is looking at a mitigation plan which Mr. Tannariello said was also a condition of the Zoning Board of Appeals.

AI said his fear is that the plan currently exists as an equation that satisfies Zoning while failing to graciously fit into the neighborhood and respect the land, questioned the need for a three-story, two-family building. MM noted a two-family as currently exists but said that before the demolition could be approved by the HDC, a viable design plan should be in place with a smaller footprint; recommended some outreach to the neighbors.

Mr. Franklin said the terrain of the road is itself a problem for construction. Ms. White asked for clarification of the current square footage as exists with that as proposed. Mr. Smith said he did not have the proposed but cited existing as 686 for the second floor unit and 894 for the first floor unit; bedrooms to remain the same, bathroom count to go up by one. Rick Bankhead, abutter, asked per cesspool dimensions. Mr. Caccamo the legality of what is approved as being in kind, to which MM said demolition dictates that an entirely new structure adhere to plans that would meet current code for HDC as well as for the ZBA.

JD appreciated the retention of the 9/6 windows and suggested the central chimney be retained but the non-functional chimney be eliminated. AH uploaded the Locke letter.

JD made a motion to continue the decision to the hearing of June 15, 2022, HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

k. [HDC 22-109](#)

Application by **Don DiRocco**, of **Hammer Architects**, on behalf of the **Robert F. Lenzi Living Trust, Robert F. Lenzi, Trustee**, requesting to replace rotted French doors and sidelights on a south elevation and to replace 4 wood bay windows and a wood entry door in kind on an east elevation on the property located at **7 Commercial Street, U8**.

Don DiRocco presented; said the cottage at hand is the one that was flooded in the storm of 2018, noted a prior approval for a raise and repair that has since expired.

Mr. DiRocco outlined the changes as proposed, said a raise is not planned for now; current doors replaced in the 1990s – to be switched out.

MM asked per the width of the chimney, to which Mr. DiRocco said the chimney would remain and only the doors and Bays would be changed.

JD made a motion to accept as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

5. **Review and approval of Minutes:** June 1, July 20, August 3, 2016, May 4 and 18, 2022.

None approved.

6. **Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN**

Per Town Clerk, the following decisions were filed on May 19, 2022:

HDC 22-29, 12 Commercial St.

HDC 22-56, 286 Bradford St.

HDC 22-72, 162 Commercial St.

HDC 22-83, 617 Commercial St.

HDC 22-89, 625 Commercial St.

Per HS, the following decisions were assigned:

AI: 49 Commercial St.; 54 Commercial St.

HS: 119 Commercial St.; 69 Pleasant St.

MM: 397 Commercial St.

JD made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:24pm. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0; HS, MM, AI, JD.

Respectfully Submitted,
Jody O'Neil