



## Historic District Commission

# Minutes

**The Provincetown Historic District Commission Public Meeting of Wednesday, October 19, 2022 at 3:30 PM in the Judge Welsh Room at Town Hall, 260 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA 02657.**

Members present: Laurie Delmolino (LD), Chair, Historical Commission Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Clerk, Chamber of Commerce Rep.; Chris Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.; Michela Murphy (MM), Alternate; Anthony Iannucci (AI), Alternate.

Excused absence: John Dowd, Vice-Chair, PGB Rep.

Staff present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner; Thaddeus Soulé (TS), Town Planner.

TS called the meeting to order at 3:30pm, read meeting protocols. LD gave roll-call.

Agenda item may be taken out of order and votes may be taken on any of the agenda items below. *The meeting will end at 7:00 P.M. Any application not heard will be postponed or continued until the next scheduled meeting.*

- Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the November 2, 2022, Public Hearing agenda and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.**

### VOTES MAY BE TAKEN:

LD made a motion to consider items iv), v), vi), vii) and viii) for Administrative Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

LD made a motion to consider items i), iii), ix), x), xi) and xii) for Full Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

- [613 Commercial St.](#) (*postponed from October 5<sup>th</sup>*) – To install solar panels and two awnings. Mark Kinnane presented by remote; said the box is basically same size, will provide photos. LD said that awnings are typically designated for Full Review. CM said it was hard to digest the application without comparative documentation. LD concurred, requested specifics. AH noted that the building has had a prior consideration by the Cape Cod Commission and recommended its input to determine if the addition of awnings would or would not affect the structure's historical designation. LD determined the application to be heard as a Full Review at the HDC meeting of November 16, 2022. *No vote taken.*
- [49 Bradford St., U1](#) (*request to postpone to November 2<sup>nd</sup>*) – To replace 2 windows in kind.

- iii) [423 Commercial St., U2](#) -To replace a baluster railing system with a stainless-steel cable rail system. *FUL REVIEW*
- iv) [597 Commercial St.](#) – To replace 13 windows.  
Jake Roberts of Renewal by Anderson presented by remote; said the lowers floors are all double-hangs, casements on the upper level; Fibrex replacements.  
LD made a motion to approve with the condition that wood trim be employed where applicable. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.
- v) [596 Commercial St., U3](#) -To replace 2 windows.  
Shane Mendoza from TJJ Properties presented; quoted like-in-kind replacements with trim inside and out.  
LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.
- vi) [4 Mozart Ave., U4](#) – To rebuild a retaining wall.  
Chris Daley, owner, and President of the Joshua Condominium Association presented with sample of block to be utilized in the re-build of the wall; seeking to change-out materials.  
AH said Mozart is a public way based on its designation with the Town. MM said she was fine with the plan. CM complimented the 50-page report as submitted.  
LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.
- vii) [139 Commercial St., UC](#) – To replace 2 doors and trim  
Rick Cleary presented; said existing transom will not be replaced, door located about  $\frac{3}{4}$  down the hill, plans for fiberglass, sills to be wood, PVC employed on some in the rear on the water-side.  
AH gave background on trim deterioration and prior work performed at the property. LD said the biggest concern is the change in the design of the wood door. MM said she was not in favor of so much Azek in Town but would be fine with the water table being composite.  
LD made a motion to approve with the condition that the trim around the door be wood; fiberglass door okay if in same design; plastic water table acceptable. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.
- viii) [139 Commercial St., UB](#) – To remove and replace mahogany decking, wood posts and railings.  
Rick Cleary presented; said the plan is to remove and replace rotted decking with new wood mahogany rails and balusters, wood posts but corner posts to be wrapped in PVC, all elements to be painted.  
CM stated a preference for mahogany all around. HS noted a water-side location. MM agreed with CM in stating that the PVC will not match when the structure weathers.  
LD made a motion to approve with mahogany decking, wood posts and railings, all wood on the structure. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

- ix) [167 Bradford St.](#) – To reconfigure doors and windows on 2 structures. *FULL REVIEW*
- x) [153 Commercial St.](#) - To replace west elevation siding, exterior stairs, decks, and rails, to remove, reconfigure and replace doors on a structure, and to replace fencing. *FULL REVIEW*
- xi) [309 Bradford St.](#) – To install a shed. *FULL REVIEW*
  
- xii) [162 Commercial St.](#) – To replace a second-floor back deck rubber roof, decking, and rails, and to replace driveway basement pressure-treated access rails with Azek.  
No one presented.

LD recommended a sample of the materials be presented for consideration prior to approval – with photos. AH oriented the structure as on the north side of Commercial St.

LD made a motion to consider as Full Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

- xiii) [352 Commercial St.](#) – To replace an existing fence.

No one presented.

AH identified the property as the Off-Center Gallery; picket fence identified as the feature intended to be concealed.

LF made a motion to consider for Full Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

## 2. Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:

### Copper Porch Roof at 419 Commercial Street

Christine Barker presented by remote, referenced formerly approved shingle roof replacement on black asphalt be exchanged for a new copper roof to patina naturally. MM and AI said they were fine with it.

MM made a motion to approve a roof modification from shingle to copper on the porch at 419 Commercial Street. LD seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, HS, CM, AI, LD.

## 3. Public Comments: On any matter not on the agenda below.

None fielded.

## 4. Full Hearings:

- a. [HDC 21-242](#) (continued from the meeting of July 6<sup>th</sup>)  
Application by **Brian Alexander**, on behalf of **James A. Green et al.**, requesting to install new windows on the northeast corner sleeping porch on the structure located at **592 Commercial Street**.  
LD made a motion to withdraw the application without prejudice at the applicant's request. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, HS, CM, AI, LD.
- b. [HDC 22-11](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)  
Application by **Brian Calhoon**, on behalf of **Rainbow Connection Realty, LLC**, requesting to replace balconies on the south facade and to reconstruct the west facade decks,

balconies, and stairwell to include a lift so that the first floor becomes more accessible on the structure located at **174 Commercial Street**.

LD invoked the Mullin Rule. CM recused himself as an abutter.

Brian Calhoun presented with revisions including a shortened middle balcony, stated a preference for Option B.

Chris Mathieson, direct abutter at 1 Winthrop St., said he was not in favor of either plan, but would prefer Option A if necessary, opined that there is nothing historic with a sliding glass door; referenced the same proposal at 136 Bradford St. where the HDC approved to retain the Second Empire look; cited related historical significance with the Prince Albert property and how added elements over time have diminished the structure's historic roots, deleting its historic value.

MM said her preference would be for Option A and would comply with the sliders but only because they are pre-existing. LD noted a previous cruise ship look to the design plan. AI wished to see repairs performed to what is currently there; to replace in kind with no additions. MM said she would abstain as the newly proposed changes were not what was proposed by the HDC. HS agreed with AI in terms of not appreciating the added bulk. AH advised that specs would be required for replacement in kind. Mr. Calhoun explained that the proposal to extend the second-floor balcony posts is to prevent further piercing into the bathroom in the first-floor bump-out and his resistance to replacing in kind based on the undesirable changes made in the 1980s.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the hearing of November 2, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, MM, AI, LD.

c. [HDC 22-118](#)

Application by **Jay Abbiuso** requesting to remove and replace a 6' fence on the south elevation and add a 3' fence and gate on the west elevation of the property located at **19 Central Street, U4**.

Jay Abbiuso presented; said the fence is the last piece to be completed in the project with gates added to the Bradford St. side at about 30', wide picket; stockade fence along Central St. side to be replaced with 6' cedar privacy variety which LD suggested would be improved by adding a swoop. Mr. Abbiuso agreed, said Landmark would perform the work.

No public comments or letters.

LD made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the last eight feet of the solid board fence as it hits the street will be a swoop of 3' up to 5', or to a limit of 6'. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, CM, MM, AI, LD.

MM left the meeting at 4:53pm.

d. [HDC 22-139](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Doug Dolezal**, on behalf of **Thomas G. Myers et al.**, requesting to demolish 2 structures on a parcel, divide the parcel into 2 Lots (A and B), and construct 5 new dwelling units on Lot A and a two-family structure on Lot B on the property located at **27 Winthrop Street**.

Doug Dolezal and co-owner presented; referenced earlier site visit.

Dr. Gerri Spinella, neighbor, spoke by remote: asked how the scope of the project will impact the water table and preservation of the cemetery and how the HDC is working with other investigations on the project proposal, to which LD outlined the HDC's exclusive purview regarding design.

David Carey of 25 Winthrop St. spoke by remote; expressed surprise that the HDC had no direct affiliation with the Cemetery Commission when arbitrating applications. LD replied that possibly the Historical Commission has a role in those matters.

Brad Mallow presented; said the poles on the hill were not presented or discussed by the applicant and expressed his disappointment that even while it is not the HDC's purview, only half of what will happen on the hill was presented to this Board.

Mr. Dolezal said the water issues have been addressed per the Town and State and that they would go before the Conservation Commission and Planning Board; buildings to be utilized as retaining walls; Lot #2 lies outside the flood plain and has less slope issues.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the hearing of November 2, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.

e. [HDC 22-148](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Bradford Walker**, on behalf of **Terrence A. West**, requesting to renovate a structure, including replacing, relocating, and reconfiguring windows, replacing front and rear doors, replacing a fence, relocating a shed, lifting an existing gable roof by 36", removing two block chimneys, adding a new cross-gable extension on the east elevation, and adding a sloped dormer on the west elevation on the property located at **15 Bradford Street**.

Brad Walker and Terry West, owner, presented. Mr. Walker proposed what he said was a small addition to the east façade with the roof to be lifted to the permissible height of 36" which will allow access to the attic for a legal bedroom and bathroom; dormer shrunk to 5" or as much as possible for a stair with ridge height dropped under the direction of HDC.

Mr. West said he is a permanent Town resident with a consulting business out of his house which is to be a family home; has met with and conferred with all his neighbors on the history of the house and his plans. Mr. Walker expressed a synergy with the architect and the owner while keeping the home in the spirit and context of the original.

AH read names and addresses from a partial list of the 24 new letters in support on file, from Oct. 5, 2022 through Oct. 16, 2022; two older letters in support: Ethan Hanabury of 24 Franklin St., U3, June 27, 2022; Christopher Flint of 22 Franklin St., July 25, 2022.

CM related he felt the design was well conceived, to which HS concurred, adding that the site visit made a difference. AI said he felt it was too much and the added mass will ruin the structure. Mr. Walker replied in saying that they took great considerations to keep the mass down and that they shared the same goals as the HDC in going just a little bit up and a little bit out; said ridge will rise 3'4" to which LD said is adding a good deal of mass and will no longer resemble the same house. AI added it will look like a lighthouse on this section of Bradford. Mr. Walker gave dimensions as 1,120 sq. ft. existing, 1,370 proposed.

CM spoke of the verticality of the house which he suggested will not deter but be an enhancement to this particular stretch of street. Mr. Walker said Bradford St. was about 3-4' lower when the house was built but that the ground has risen, unsafely, through the years.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the hearing of November 2, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.

f. [HDC 22-164](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Terrell Jordan** requesting to modify and replace a fence on the property located at **165 Commercial Street**.

Terrell Jordan presented by remote; displayed pictorial of fence swanning up on either side of the rear gate to the property from the beach, lowest fence section currently at 43" and reaching 72" at top posts of the gate; proposing to raise pickets to 54" at the gate.

LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed: 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.

LD announced a short recess.

- g. [HDC 22-191](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)  
Application by **Kevin Bazarian** requesting to renovate a structure, including adding a basement, an addition to the north elevation, and a dormer, replacing decks and stairs, and a picket fence, and to renovate a free-standing cottage by constructing a second floor and a poured foundation on the property located at **10 Bradford Street**.  
Kevin Bazarian presented; referenced changes as removing front dormer on south elevation and return to existing skylight, left side or west elevation, dormer brought in by 3'.  
CM said the cottage design does not read as historical, referenced cottage across the street by example, felt dormer could be pulled in a bit on the west elevation. HS said she only had the older plans to go by currently but agreed with CM in that as proposed the cottage appears to be a bit much. AI agreed, citing a big jump in the height plans, appreciated lowering the cottage per the house but the bulk, as such, still seems to overwhelm. LD suggested that the Board did not currently have a way to get from existing to proposed at this juncture with a new height quoted at 21'2"; proposed dropping the ridge.  
Deb Asbrand spoke from the public, referenced the cottage policy and mitigating factors for the HDC to approve cottage raises to one and half stories, suggested the property line is at issue, as well.  
AH read from two letters: Benjamin Williams of [12 Cottage St., U3](#), who expressed concern over the increased mass, referenced his own HDC approved cottage as an example of appropriate structure at 2' less in height than the applicant has proposed; and from abutters at [10A Bradford St., U3](#), Parker Heckner and Alec Papazian, encouraging the cottage be moved closer to the existing structure and away from their own property line.  
LD pondered an expanded footprint. AI clarified a 4-family property. AH cautioned per a permitted increased lot size in a green space. LD summarized options.  
LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 2, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.
- h. [HDC 22-201](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)  
Application by **Mark Kinnane**, on behalf of **Dean Landy et al**, requesting to change/move windows on the rear of the structure located at **4 Miller Hill Road, U8**.  
Mark Kinnane presented by remote; indicated window changes on backside, per A.2 and the trim moved over to balance both levels of fenestration.  
No public comments or letters.  
LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.
- i. [HDC 22-202](#) (continued from the meeting of October 5<sup>th</sup>)  
Application by **Robert Silva** requesting to replace a window with a slider on the structure located at **5 Conwell Street**.  
Scott Silva and Nicholas Silva presented; window spec identified in the diagram.  
LD related that fiberglass doors are not historically appropriate, suggested the Simpson wood door could work at the property.  
LD made a motion to approve with the condition the door and all trim be wood. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.
- j. [HDC 22-207](#)  
Application by **Jeff Purcell**, on behalf of **Dennis J. Syracuse et al.**, requesting to add two dormers on the structure located at **233 Bradford Street, U9**.  
Jeff Purcell presented; quoted shed dormers to add needed headroom, all details to match, natural cedar shingles and painted clapboards, Anderson 400 series, 6/1.  
No public comments or letters.

LD spoke of dormers not dominating the roof, which she noted is the case with these current plans; recommended two smaller, doghouse dormers based on visibility factor or reducing sheds by 3'.

AH read a letter in support from the Provincetown Theater.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 2, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-0-0: HS, CM, AI, LD.

k. **HDC 22-208**

Application by **Bill Fornaciari**, on behalf of **Robert P. Tosner**, requesting to replace windows on the structure located at **1A Winthrop Street**.

Bill Fornaciari presented; said they are seeking to replace two windows on the leftwing of the front elevation with three smaller windows centered on the facade; main house and addition both built possibly in the 1980s.

No public comments or letters.

LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0: HS, AI, LD. CM recused as direct abutter.

CM left the meeting at 6:55pm.

l. **HDC 22-210**

Application by **Nicholas Busa** requesting to remove and replace existing windows, add skylights, and add a new front door on the structure located at **650 Commercial Street**.

Nicholas Busa and Shola Reis, owners, presented. Mr. Busa said the home was built in 1920 and had rooms for rent; requesting 1/1 windows for consistency, aluminum clad Pella; sliding glass door as has been approved and installed at a neighboring property.

AH reported nine letters in support, including from Bob Hazard and Helene Watt, adjacent neighbors at 652 Commercial St., the sister house.

LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0: HS, AI, LD.

5. **Review and approval of Minutes:**

LD made a motion to approve the meeting minutes of September 21, 2022. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0: HS, AI, LD.

HS said she will be at the November 2nd meeting but then not available for the November 16<sup>th</sup> meeting or possibly beyond, until further notice.

AH mentioned recommendations from Sarah Korjoff of the Cape Cod Commission which she said related to Brad Walker, reporting that the applicant would reduce the width of the corner boards, flat stock, and also to only employ clapboard on the front at 622 Commercial St.

6. **Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN**

Per HS, decisions will be written as follows:

AI: 613 Commercial St.; 423 Commercial St.

MM: 167 Bradford St.; 153 Commercial St.

HS: 309 Bradford St.; 352 Commercial St.; 162 Commercial St.; 19 Central St., U4; 165 Commercial St.; 4 Miller Hill Rd. U8; 5 Conwell St.; 1A Winthrop St.; 650 Commercial St.

Filed with the Town Clerk on October 7, 2022:

**HDC 22-192, 558 Commercial St.; HDC 22-195, 898 Commercial St.**

LD made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:10pm. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0:  
HS, AI, LD.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jody O'Neil