



## Historic District Commission

# Minutes

**The Provincetown Historic District Commission Public Meeting of Wednesday, November 2, 2022 at 3:30 PM in the Judge Welsh Room at Town Hall, 260 Commercial Street, Provincetown, MA 02657.**

Members present: Laurie Delmolino (LD), Chair, Historical Commission Rep.; John Dowd, (JD) Vice-Chair, PGB Rep.; Hersh Schwartz (HS), Clerk, Chamber of Commerce Rep.; Chris Mathieson (CM), PAAM Rep.; Michela Murphy (MM), Alternate; Anthony Iannucci (AI), Alternate.

Staff present: Annie Howard (AH), Building Commissioner; Thaddeus Soulé (TS), Town Planner. TS called the meeting to order at 3:30pm, read meeting protocols. LD gave roll-call.

Agenda item may be taken out of order and votes may be taken on any of the agenda items below.

*The meeting will end at 7:00 P.M. Any application not heard will be postponed or continued until the next scheduled meeting.*

- 1. Determination as to whether the applications below involve any Exterior Architectural Features within the jurisdiction of the Commission; with Full Reviews to be placed on the November 16, 2022 Public Hearing agenda and Administrative Reviews to be acted on by a subcommittee appointed by the Commission.**

### **VOTES MAY BE TAKEN:**

LD made a motion to consider items i), ii), iii), and vii) for Administrative Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

LD made a motion to consider items iv), v), vi) for Full Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

- 49 Bradford St., U1** (*postponed from the meeting of October 19<sup>th</sup>*) – To replace 2 windows in kind.  
Emerson Carvalho presented; confirmed one window on the first floor and one on the second to be replaced; both wood for wood.  
LD made a motion to approve as presented; wood for wood, including trim.  
MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, HS, JD, CM, LD.

- ii) [408 Commercial St.](#) – To replace stainless steel cable rail system in kind.  
 AH said the applicant, Derik Burgess, was not able to present at this time; referenced forwarded e-mail with accompanying photo.  
 CM said the wood posts should be retained as wood and that he had issue with the work being done without the HDC’s permission. JD opted for metal to go with metal. LD agreed with JD, as did HS and MM.  
 LD made a motion to approve as presented. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 4-1-0: HS, JD, MM, LD, in favor; CM, opposed.
  
- iii) [254 Bradford St.](#) – To replace a front door, 1 triple, 3 double and 5 single windows in kind and to re-shingle front of house, 4 dormers, and back left side of house.  
 An identified woman presented; clarified the application.  
 LD made a motion to consider as Administrative Review. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.  
 Applicant said she was a new owner of the 1800s Dutch Colonial two-family house, cited past replacements and triple-paned windows as newly recommended.  
 CM said he was not in favor of fiberglass door. LD gave wood door options.  
 Applicant said she would take another look to find a suitable style and added that the siding is also in bad shape, covering the entire front. JD offered a half-light option.  
 LD made a motion to approve with the condition that the front door be wood with a single half-lite on the top, panels on the lower half. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.
  
- iv) [58 Bradford St., U1](#) - To add a ground level deck with a wrap-around 32” picket fence.
- v) [35 Bradford St.](#) – To replace a slider on the south elevation, two windows on the north elevation, and to mount a "sun tunnel" on the roof.
- vi) [188 Bradford St.](#) – To replace wooden double stairs and walk to the front door with brick stairs and walk and to replace 2 sets of 1 over 1 double-hung windows with 6 over 1 windows on the front elevation.
  
- vii) [148 Commercial St., U4](#) – To replace existing trim with azek, existing shingles on left, right and rear of building, a window in-kind, and existing roof shingles.  
 No one presented.  
 AH said the applicant has secured a work permit based on prior HDC approvals. LD said the trim should remain wood as it is on Commercial St. but that the rear of the building could apply plastic trim.  
 LD made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the trim be wood except on rear façade. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

**2. Any other business that shall properly come before the Commission:**

LD made a motion to extend approval of **HDC 21-263, 7 Arch Street** for one year.  
 HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

**3. Public Comments:** On any matter not on the agenda below.

None fielded.

#### 4. Full Hearings:

a. [HDC 22-11](#) (continued from the meeting of October 19<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Brian Calhoon**, on behalf of **Rainbow Connection Realty, LLC**, requesting to replace balconies on the south facade and to reconstruct the west facade decks, balconies, and stairwell to include a lift so that the first floor becomes more accessible on the structure located at **174 Commercial Street**.

No one presented; AH said new drawings were uploaded today and that the only unresolved issue concerns the brackets.

LD made a motion to approve as presented. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, JD, HS, AI, LD. CM, recused.

b. [HDC 22-139](#) (continued from the meeting of October 19<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Doug Dolezal**, on behalf of **Thomas G. Myers et al.**, requesting to demolish 2 structures on a parcel, divide the parcel into 2 Lots (A and B), and construct 5 new dwelling units on Lot A and a two-family structure on Lot B on the property located at **27 Winthrop Street**.

Doug Dolezal presented with the owners; placed the focus of today's hearing on Lot #2, at 32 Court St. and spoke of reductions in dimensions as directed by the HDC. Changes to Lot #1 include reducing the size and height of chimneys, dormer adjustments and width of windows; vertical board left natural, white cedar trim on the south face, and less fenestration.

Brad Mallow of 25 Winthrop St.; referenced a breakdown of 11 abutters opposed to the project; said that per the last 10 years of HDC recorded minutes no known property has ever allowed two structures to be demolished on the same lot – except for the Town-owned site at 3 Jerome Smith Road. Mr. Mallow said that if the initial plans of this project in February had been shared with the abutters perhaps the deliberations might have developed differently.

Anu Avanti thanked the HDC, asked if the property, which she appraised at 13,000 square feet, should be considered as separate lots without an official designation as such; spoke of the potential for damage of the cemetery vegetation and lack of retaining wall.

Daniel Skahan of 25 Winthrop St., spoke against the proposal, stating his opinion that the proposed buildings are not in line with the neighborhood architecture and character.

LD clarified that the HDC did not vote for final approval of the Winthrop St. lot.

JD said he felt the proportion of windows at Lot #1 is still not correct or in keeping; said he was pretty much okay with the modern building materials and contemporary scale. Mr. Dolezal said they could lower the kitchen window and make it smaller at 2'3x4'6, less vertical or drop the header down; asked if 2'6"x5" would work, to which JD did not concur. LD said shorter and wider is what he HDC would seek in this design feature.

AI proposed an aspect ratio that was more relatable to which Mr. Dolezal said he would re-work to that end.

JD said he had a problem with the applicant's representation of a 17<sup>th</sup> century saltbox where a 19<sup>th</sup> century Greek Revival was more apropos, but that he was okay with what he saw as the architectural – as opposed to monolithic - tricks applied to make a larger structure appear smaller.

CM said that when he looked at the design, he could not see Provincetown. MM agreed with AI in that the window change could result in approval; cited the extreme housing crisis in her approval of the project. AI recommended making some minor adjustments and then moving on with an approval. HS said that if not for the Town's need for housing she might not approve the design.

LD noted that affordable housing is not the HDC's purview but suggested that few could afford the affordable unit offered by this proposal. Mr. Dolezal said there are seven

units in total, six new with one affordable and one a worker-force unit and the 7<sup>th</sup> being the owner's home. MM repeated her wishes for affordable housing to keep people in Town. LD expressed that the new architecture and affordable housing can work in tandem, but that the HDC needs to see new drawings with both the symmetrical and asymmetrical renderings on the same page to approve. JD said the amount of glass read corporate and not residential, which Mr. Dolezal said they would address.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2022. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, JD, CM, HS, LD.

c. [HDC 22-148](#) (continued from the meeting of October 19<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Bradford Walker**, on behalf of **Terrence A. West**, requesting to renovate a structure, including replacing, relocating, and reconfiguring windows, replacing front and rear doors, replacing a fence, relocating a shed, lifting an existing gable roof by 36", removing two block chimneys, adding a new cross-gable extension on the east elevation, and adding a sloped dormer on the west elevation on the property located at **15 Bradford Street**.

Brad Walker and Terry West presented. Mr. Walker walked through principle improvements including removal of the chain link fence and parking along Bradford, full-frame double-hung window replacements as more traditional; removing two concrete block chimneys, replacing all siding, consolidating parking at rear of the house and cleaning up the retaining wall, replacing picture window on the front with a front door with a simpler hood, eave and gable trim to replicate existing, lowered proposed ridge, removed corner boards to simplify eave in its vocabulary; all windows made less narrow although not less high, ground floor windows to match upper story units, reduced dormer.

MM reported no new letters since prior meeting; Mr. Walker noted 26 letters of support on file including from all abutters.

MM stated the Board's prerogative to allow structures to go up or out, but not both, and voiced concern that the changes as proposed could alter the building's contributing status in the Historic District. JD said he found the revised drawings very sensitive to the nature of the building and a minor addition to the existing overall; is in full support. LD and AI reminded JD that the windows are not historically correct. AH noted the current plans in discussion are dated October 19<sup>th</sup>.

LD cited the steroid affect at hand, to which AI added the building's English basement as a character-defining trait of the structure, encouraged the applicant to take a look at the house at 11 Franklin St. for reference which, he said, nicely developed downwardly whereas this proposal is like a Tower of Pisa.

CM agreed with JD, made a comparison to the proposal just heard at Winthrop and Court Streets. HS remarked that there are many other local buildings with larger ells but that the dormer makes the structure too modernized and is opposed to a 4' raise, which LD said will remove its contributing status and CM said will negate his approval of the plans.

Mr. Walker offered window adjustments made to meet code compliance. Mr. West said two contractors did not support digging any further down than is already defined by the basement, has not spoken to an engineer. Height, loss of contributing status: key factors.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2022 for the purpose of securing tangible evidence that the new height proposal will not preclude Historic Contribution. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

A short recess was taken.

d. [HDC 22-191](#) (request to continue to the meeting of November 16<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Kevin Bazarian** requesting to renovate a structure, including adding a basement, an addition to the north elevation, and a dormer, replacing decks and stairs,

and a picket fence, and to renovate a free-standing cottage by constructing a second floor and a poured foundation on the property located at **10 Bradford Street**.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2022.

CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: CM, JD, HS, MM, LD.

e. [HDC 22-207](#) (continued from the meeting of October 19<sup>th</sup>)

Application by **Jeff Purcell**, on behalf of **Dennis J. Syracuse et al.**, requesting to add two dormers on the structure located at **233 Bradford Street, U9**.

Jeff Purcell presented; said photos will be taken to verify visibility; remarked on removed window on the second floor, matched shutters, siding and roofing.

No public comments or letters.

LD made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the rear dormer not be visible from the street. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: HS, JD, CM, MM, LD.

f. [HDC 22-216](#)

Application by **Christopher Nagle**, on behalf of the **Emilie W. Oppenheim Revocable Trust**, requesting to reconfigure windows and doors on two structures on the property located at **167 Bradford Street**.

Chris Nagle presented; said the two units or residences are on one parcel with 1980s Anderson windows, seeking more traditional 2/2s with black/white trim, shingles; front doors changed to two light, two panel, wood. Files could not be located.

MM read a letter of approval from the resident at 10 Washington Ave.

LD made a motion to approve as presented. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, JD, CM, HS, LD.

g. [HDC 22-223](#)

Application by **Ginny Binder** requesting to replace west elevation siding, exterior stairs, decks, and rails, to remove, reconfigure and replace doors on a structure, and to replace fencing on the property located at **153 Commercial Street**.

Ginny Binder and Bill Filaretos, owner of Unit 2, presented. Ms. Binder said they were seeking to clean up the building, which was greatly overhauled in 1985, and give it a nice, fresh look. Mr. Filaretos addressed a professional, digital rendering as submitted; white cable rail proposed.

No public comments or letters.

JD said cable rail could be acceptable in this case as the back of the building is so janky. AI asked why cables, to which Filaretos said the decision had to do with bringing 400 balusters up to code, which would necessitate another hundred balusters. JD noted no 19<sup>th</sup> century detailing, to which MM said the building is nonetheless a contributing structure and that the HDC has been very consistent in not allowing cable rail except on the water side. HS agreed with JD. CM agreed with MM. Mr. Filaretos referenced the building next to the Boat slip bearing cable, but which AI said failed to make the case. Ms. Binder said she could present a PVC material for HDC inspection.

LD made a motion to approve as presented with the condition that the railing system be vertical and either wood or an acceptable composite, with cable rail minimally visible on the bay side. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: CM, JD, HS, MM, LD.

h. [HDC 22-225](#)

Application by **Cynthia Packard** requesting to install a shed on the property located at **309 Bradford Street**.

AH said Ms. Packard is not available to present today, but that she had spoken to Megan at length about the picket fence. LD said more specifics were needed.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2022. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: CM, JD, HS, MM, LD.

i. [HDC 22-233](#)

Application by **Jonah Swain**, on behalf of the **Michael F. Fernon Revocable Trust**, requesting to replace a second-floor back deck rubber roof, decking, and rails, and to replace driveway basement pressure-treated access rails with Azek on the structure located at **162 Commercial Street**.

Jonah Swain presented by remote. LD asked if a sample of could be brought in for review including handrail, spindle and post; shared that the end of the deck can be seen from the street.

LD made a motion to continue the decision to the meeting of November 16, 2022. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: CM, JD, HS, MM, LD.

j. [HDC 22-234](#)

Application by **Jill Rothenberg-Simmons**, on behalf of **Wareham Investment Group, LLC**, requesting to replace an existing fence on the property located at **352 Commercial Street**.

Scott Presley, of On-Center Gallery, and Jill Rothenberg-Simmons presented. LD expressed that many property owners are the victims of fence companies who fail to advise their customers of the need to seek HDC approval. Applicant related that the company in question is Landmark. Ms. Rothenberg-Simmons said they just installed 25' feet of new fence which stands at 6' at its highest peak. AH thanked the applicant for their response to the violation letter.

No public comments or letters.

JD rated the fence as obstructionist and inhospitable; would never have been approved. LD concurred. CM asked if a remedy could be had through landscaping.

LD made a motion to approve with a 4' picket replacement in the first section and swoop up to 6' in the second section. CM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: CM, JD, HS, AI, LD.

**5. Review and approval of Minutes:**

LD made a motion to approve the HDC meeting minutes of October 5, 2022. MM seconded the motion and it passed, 5-0-0: MM, CM, JD, HS, LD.

CM left the meeting at 6:52pm. MM left the meeting at 6:53pm.

**6. Deliberations on Pending Decisions: VOTES MAY BE TAKEN**

Full Review decisions to be written by AI: [35 Bradford St.](#); [58 Bradford St.](#), [188 Bradford St.](#). AI to take up HS's clerical notation regarding decisions in her absence.

LD made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:26pm. HS seconded the motion and it passed, 3-0-0: HS, AI, LD.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jody O'Neil